FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

+ + + + +

ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON DIVERSITY FOR

COMMUNICATIONS IN THE DIGITAL AGE

+ + + + +

WEDNESDAY

MARCH 24, 2010

+ + + + +

The meeting convened in the FCC Meeting Room at 445 12th Street, SW, Washington, D.C., at 2:00 p.m., Henry Rivera, Chairman, presiding.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

HENRY RIVERA, Chairman
GEOFFREY C. BLACKWELL
ANTOINETTE (TONI) BUSH
RALPH D. EVERETT
DAVID HONIG

JANE MAGO
KAREN K. NARASAKI
ANDREW SCHWARTZMAN
DIANE SUTTER
CHARLES WARFIELD
JAMES WINSTON

FCC COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:
JULIUS GENACHOWSKI, Chairman
MIGNON CLYBURN, Commissioner

FCC STAFF PRESENT:

BARBARA KREISMAN, Designated Federal Officer

JAMILA BESS-JOHNSON, Deputy Federal Officer

CAROLYN FLEMING WILLIAMS, Deputy Federal

      Officer

JOHN HORRIGAN, Director, Consumer Research,

      Omnibus Broadband Initiative

THOMAS REED, Director, Office of

Communications and Business Opportunities

VISITORS:

ANNE LUCEY, CBS

JON P. GANT, Joint Center for Political &

      Economic Studies

NICOL TURNER-LEE, Vice President, Director,

      Joint Center for Political and Economic

      Studies

SUSAN FOX, Disney

SYLVIA STROBEL, Alliance for Women in Media

YING LI, Joint Center for Political & Economic

      Studies

A-G-E-N-D-A

1   P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2   (2:05 p.m.)

3   MS. KREISMAN: Okay, people on the

4   phone please mute your phones before you speak

5   - I mean, until you want to speak because we

6   have background noise. The people in the

7   control office or booth have already asked me

8   - that they've heard a lot of extra noise. If

9   you all could please mute what's there. And

10   if you put us on hold, make sure you don't

11   have music going on. And the other general

12   instruction is please speak into the mics and

13   wait a minute because it takes awhile for them

14   to get going. So with those very preliminary

15   matters I'll say good afternoon to members,

16   Chairman Rivera.

17   Welcome to the spring meeting of

18   the Advisory Committee for Diversity in the

19   Digital Age. I'm told it's beautiful outside

20   so we picked a good day. This is the first

21   meeting of the final year of our present

22   charter and that expires in December - early

1   December of this year so the pressure is on

2   for anything else this group may want to do.

3   Thank you for taking time out from your busy

4   schedules to be here today and also on the

5   telephone. You have a packet of information

6   before you that has - and it also has been

7   emailed to everyone on the phone. It includes

8   today's agenda, committee reports, proposed

9   recommendations and PowerPoint presentations.

10   We'll refer to it through the meeting. Our

11   features today include a presentation by Diane

12   Sutter representing the Media Issues Working

13   Group. John Horrigan has joined us to discuss

14   aspects of the Commission's Broadband Plan.

15   Members of the Joint Center for Political and

16   Economic Studies are here to present their

17   report focusing on broadband for minorities.

18   We thank them very much for joining us today.

19   With that I turn the proceedings over to

20   Chairman Rivera.

21   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Thank you,

22   Barbara, and welcome all. I'm so glad you

 1   guys could make it and for those of you on the

 2   phone, thank you for taking time out of your

 3   schedules to be with us. Before we get

 4   started I want to turn the floor over to Andy

 5   Schwartzman who has a very special

 6   announcement to make.

 7   MR. SCHWARTZMAN: Thank you. I

 8   apologize for what's a little bit

 9   inappropriate for a meeting like this, but I

10   think it's with enough pleasure that I can

11   share that I'd like to do this. As of 2

12   o'clock which is around eight minutes ago

13   Media Access Project announced that I'm

14   stepping aside to become the senior vice

15   president and policy director of Media Access

16   Project which frees me of a lot of

17   administrative stuff, and we're going to have

18   a new president who is known to many of you,

19   Tyrone Brown. He's leaving Wiley Rein and

20   he's coming to Media Access Project, and we're

21   just as excited as can be. And because he's

22   very important to so many of the people in

1   this community I wanted to take the

2   opportunity to tell you about it.

3   (Applause)

4   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Thank you Andy,

5   and congratulations. Our loss at Wiley Rein

6   is certainly your gain. The other thing I

7   would like to mention before we get started is

8   that the chairman will join us today. He is

9   on the Hill. I'm sure he'd much rather be

10   here with us, but he's running a little late.

11   So whenever he comes in we'll stop whatever it

12   is that we're doing and let him address us and

13   raise whatever matters he wishes to raise with

14   us. So just wanted to alert you about that.

15   And with that, as Barbara said we've got a

16   terrific agenda for you this afternoon and we

17   want to start with our business matters. I'm

18   going to turn it over to Diane whose

19   subcommittee has been very, very busy these

20   past three months. So Diane, the floor is

21   yours.

22   MS. SUTTER: Thank you, Henry. As

 1   you know, the Media Issues Subcommittee is

 2   divided into three task forces, the first

 3   being PPM, the second EEO and the third

 4   Funding Acquisitions. The PPM task force has

 5   been keeping close tabs on what's been going

 6   on with the new changes at Arbitron and while

 7   they have no recommendation at this point for

 8   the full committee to consider, they continue

 9   to be actively involved in observing, watching

10   and making sure that the process continues to

11   move with resolution on PPM that is sought by

12   everyone involved I think. You have a

13   statement from them in your packet. I won't

14   go through it in more detail so that you'll

15   have the opportunity to just see that. The

16   second task force is our EEO task force and

17   Jane Mago chairs that task force and I've

18   asked Jane on behalf of her group to report on

19   their recommendations.

20   MS. MAGO: Thank you, Diane. The

21   EEO subgroup as part of the Media Issues

22   Subcommittee met telephonically a number of

 1   times to discuss the various issues that we

 2   thought were relevant to promoting the

 3   interest of EEO both - not just in the media

 4   industry but across platforms. And the

 5   specifics, you have the report that's there in

 6   the packet that gives the report from the

 7   committee and we have just basically three

 8   points that we wanted to make today. One is

 9   to recognize and thank Chairman Genachowski

10   for his responsiveness to the earlier

11   recommendations that we had to try to pull

12   together a forum to discuss the EEO issues,

13   and we want to reach out with the folks at the

14   OCBO here at the FCC and make sure that that

15   moves along and goes forward. We're very

16   pleased that that's an action that he

17   recognized and is willing to take.

18   Secondly, we have two

19   recommendations that we'd like the Commission

20   to try to consider. One is in recognition of

21   the changes in the way that recruiting -

22   employment recruiting takes place, that the

 1   internet has become a very important part of

 2   recruiting and the Commission's rules at this

 3   point haven't quite recognized that as one of

 4   the possible recruiting tools. And so we're

 5   making a recommendation that the agency should

 6   in fact recognize internet recruiting as one

 7   of the potential tools. Mr. Chairman? Henry

 8   told us we were going to interrupt, so.

 9   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Well, as I told

10   you the chairman had planned to join us and

11   here he is and we have a bonus with

12   Commissioner Clyburn, so we're awfully glad to

13   see both of you. And we said we'd stop

14   everything when you got here and we would like

15   to hear from you, and so the floor is yours

16   sir.

17   FCC CHAIRMAN GENACHOWSKI:

18   Terrific. Well, first of all let me put this

19   here. It's great to see everyone. It's great

20   to see so many familiar faces and it's great

21   to be here sitting next to Commissioner

22   Clyburn who's been just such a fabulous

1   addition to the Commission. I feel lucky

2   every day that we're working together and I

3   think Rick Kaplan on your team is here. It's

4   been a - as you all know we're in the middle

5   of a busy time. You know, the agency has been

6   focused on broadband for some time, literally

7   everyone, and some people are still, you know,

8   catching up on their sleep after really quite

9   some time of not getting sleep. Some of the

10   rest of us are getting ready to go testify in

11   Congress which we'll be doing tomorrow. But

12   I did want to come by and just talk for a few

13   minutes, mostly to tell you how pleased I am

14   that this committee exists, that you're

15   working on the issues that you're working on.

16   It's incredibly important not just to the

17   Commission, but to all the people who we're

18   focused on in this changing time in these

19   areas. Let me - Henry, and this is so great

20   because I get to call you Chairman Rivera

21   which is -

22   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: It hasn't gone

 1 to my head.

 2   (Laughter)

 3   FCC CHAIRMAN GENACHOWSKI: No.

 4 But listen, thank you for doing this work.

 5 You know, it's a real contribution to our

 6 work. It's important to the Commission and

 7 it's a very important thing for distinguished

 8 outside participants like you to give of your

 9 time and your energy and your knowledge to

10 help advise the Commission in these areas. So

11 I appreciate it very much and we appreciate

12 each of the members of the committee for

13 putting your time into this. We don't take it

14 for granted and we know that it puts an

15 obligation on us to actually pay attention to

16 what you're talking about here, what you're

17 advising us to do and we appreciate your

18 service and we appreciate your

19 recommendations. Thank you in particular the

20 subcommittees on constitutional issues, on

21 media issues, broadband, David Honig, Diane

22 Sutter, Susan Patrick, Toni Cook Bush. Thanks

1   to all of you for working so hard in each of

2   these areas. Every day I'm sure you wake up

3   and you think there can't be any new issues

4   for us to work on and yet there are more.

5   Thanks very much Tom Reed who I'm so glad

6   you've all gotten to know. I'm going to come

7   back and chat about OCBO in a minute. I saw

8   Barbara Kreisman here, Carolyn Williams,

9   Jamila Bess-Johnson. Thanks to all of you for

10   being the ambassadors of the Commission to

11   this important advisory committee. I think

12   Charisse Smith might be here from my staff.

13   If not, I know she works very hard on these

14   issues. Danny Ornstein also helps on these as

15   do everyone on my staff and I thank them for

16   their work.

17   Let me talk mostly today about

18   broadband. We all have broadband on the

19   brain. But first I just want to touch on some

20   of the steps that I'm happy we've taken over

21   the last few months since I was confirmed.

22   First, as you know, we've reactivated, re-

          1   energized OCBO which was an office that really

          2   wanted to be reactivated and re-energized, and

          3   I'm so pleased that Tom Reed came here to take

          4   on this challenge. It's a hard challenge.

          5   Tom as you know has an extraordinary

          6   background, very relevant to the work that

          7   you're doing now. We're very grateful for you

          8   bringing your energy and your knowledge and

          9   your background here and thanks to everyone at

         10   OCBO. I know that OCBO has worked on a set of

         11   coordinated relationships with the different

         12   diversity committee subcommittees and that's

         13   very important. And as you know, Tom and

         14   others here have led a series of workshops on

         15   these areas around capital formation. Tom,

         16   you'll probably talk about it a little bit

         17   more. If I remember correctly you did two

         18   workshops during the broadband proceeding -

         19   three including the small business one, so

         20   three altogether. Very widely attended and

         21   important, and actually produced, as did the

         22   advisory committee's letters recommendation

 1   that we were able to take advantage of. I

 2   know one of the things, Tom, that you did in

 3   the capital strategy session is coordinate

 4   one-on-one sessions between companies and

 5   potential funders, and I think this kind of

 6   work, to think really creatively in addition

 7   to looking at our rules and our policies, but

 8   also thinking how can we play a role in

 9   bringing entrepreneurs, small businesses,

10   capital together to increase the

11   relationships, increase the knowledge,

12   increase the chances of success. I know

13   that's something that you're focused on that

14   we spent a lot of time talking about that I

15   think is just terrific.

16   OCBO of course has worked very

17   closely with the national broadband team on

18   its recommendations and you see their input

19   throughout the report. And I'm also pleased

20   that Tom and OCBO have been working on

21   developing and strengthening interagency

22   relationships in this area with NTIA of course

 1   but also with SBA and the MBDA. All these

 2   things matter. I think we're finding this in

 3   a number of different areas. So many

 4   opportunities and challenges are developing

 5   resulting from and around changes in

 6   technology and changes in the communications

 7   landscape. And other parts of the government

 8   do look to us for information, for facts, for

 9   expertise and as I'll come back and talk about

10   in the Broadband Plan, these relationships

11   that Tom and others are building with other

12   agencies, given the horizontal nature of what

13   we do, become very important, can increase the

14   ability of government overall to tackle

15   diversity and other issues in a way that's

16   more important, faster, and can make a real

17   difference. So I think you'll hear more from

18   Tom today. I'm very excited about what's

19   happening with OCBO.

20   As you know, in addition to OCBO

21   we appointed the agency's first chief

22   diversity officer who's been hard at work and

1   has worked very hard with the Broadband Plan.

2   Our Office of Managing Director Steve

3   VanRoekel who I hope comes here at some point,

4   but has been working with Tom, with Mark on a

5   series of practical ideas to think about what

6   we can do with the agency itself in this area.

7   I will confess that some of these ideas came

8   out of suggestions from Commissioner Clyburn.

9   Actually, the best conversation I have, I go

10   meet with Commissioner Clyburn and

11   Commissioner Clyburn says quite rightly, you

12   know, maybe we should think about having the

13   agency do this and this. And I say, you know,

14   that sounds like a good idea. And then I call

15   Steve VanRoekel, and I say hey, maybe the

16   agency should do this and this, and he said,

17   oh we're already doing it. And then I call

18   Commissioner Clyburn back and say oh, you

19   know, you suggested it and it's done, and I

20   think this is a virtuous circle.

21   (Laughter)

22   FCC CHAIRMAN GENACHOWSKI: No, but

1   it's great - what's happening now, the

2   middleman is being cut out and I think it's

3   very healthy. I mean, we've encouraged all of

4   the office heads and bureau heads like Tom and

5   others to communicate directly with the

6   commissioners. There's no monopoly on good

7   ideas and my directive to each of the heads of

8   the bureaus and offices are get the best ideas

9   from wherever they come and do the right

10   thing.

11   With respect to the Managing

12   Director's Office, it's been working hard on

13   our procurement contracts - this is one of

14   Commissioner Clyburn's ideas - to make sure

15   that we're taking diversity issues into

16   account in a best practices way in that work.

17   We held the first - the first agency in the

18   federal government to open a dedicated Blacks

19   in Government space for recruitment,

20   education, career development, other programs.

21   I know that OMD is working very hard. I'm not

22   sure if I mentioned Tom Wyatt who we appointed

1   as the head of Office of Workplace Diversity.

2   But to think really hard about our own

3   recruitment practices and training practices

4   and mentoring practices at the FCC to make

5   sure that we're applying best practices,

6   leading practices in this area. I think we

7   have a lot of work left to do, but I know that

8   the team has been working very hard to make

9   progress and they've begun to make progress.

10   So that brings me to broadband.

11   It's going to be hard to tell this group

12   anything that they don't already know, but let

13   me review some of what our focus has been on

14   the Broadband Plan. First of all, I'm proud

15   of the process that was run. I really do

16   believe it was an unprecedented process in

17   terms of its openness, in terms of the

18   participation that it sought and got from very

19   broad communities that included the workshops,

20   that ones that we've talked about, many

21   others, as you know because many of you

22   participated in them. You know, we held many

 1   of them here, but also streamed online. We

 2   tried to get as many people into the workshops

 3   as they could. In fact, we had a general

 4   policy of if there was a topic that we on our

 5   own didn't think of to do a workshop on we

 6   would take ideas and try to schedule workshops

 7   because there's no topic where we shouldn't

 8   try to have that discussion. A lot of people

 9   when they think about the broadband challenges

10   in the country think about deployment and they

11   stop at deployment. You know, they think hey,

12   there are parts of the country that don't have

13   broadband, how do we get broadband to those

14   areas. Of course, it's very, very important

15   that we do that. It's very important that we

16   think of broadband like electricity, like

17   telephone service. It's a platform for

18   commerce, it's a platform for opportunity,

19   it's a platform for participation in our

20   democracy and it needs to extend everywhere in

21   the country. But to me and to the members of

22   the team it was essential that we not stop

 1   there and that we think about the adoption and

 2   affordability issues as well. It is a

 3   significant thing I think that one of the

 4   three main subject headings of the plan itself

 5   is inclusion. And it says something about the

 6   importance that the whole team and the agency

 7   put on the inclusion goal and the inclusion

 8   challenges in the Broadband Plan.

 9   As you know, thanks to Jon

10   Horrigan the team did a tremendous amount of

11   work getting its arms around what's actually

12   going on in the country with respect to

13   adoption, affordability, usage. You're all

14   familiar with the statistics, but there were -

15   reciting because they're very troubling and

16   very important that we address them. So one,

17   the overall average in the United States for

18   broadband adoption is about 65 percent which

19   is lower than other countries in the world

20   that are trying very hard to become global

21   competitors of the U.S., centers of

22   innovation, so 65 percent is just not good

 1   enough for the United States. But as you all

 2   know, not only is the U.S. lagging globally

 3   when it comes to its overall rate of adoption,

 4   but communities inside the United States are

 5   lagging, and Jon's survey confirms this, Dr.

 6   Turner-Lee's work confirms this, others. So

 7   in minority communities, in low-income

 8   communities, in rural communities, among

 9   seniors, the adoption rate is lower than 65

10   percent, in some cases much lower. In tribal

11   areas the number is so low it's embarrassing

12   even to talk about. The numbers I think that

13   we estimated is roughly a 5 percent adoption

14   rate in tribal areas, and for regular

15   telephone service the adoption rate is the 65

16   percent that it is for broadband around the

17   country.

18   These statistics are you know

19   troubling just when you say them, but when you

20   consider the rising costs of digital exclusion

21   they become even more troubling. And so five

22   years ago, ten years ago, if you were looking

1   for a job, what would you do? You would get

2   a newspaper and you would look for a job and

3   newspapers are very democratic, right? They

4   cost a quarter, they're available to everyone,

5   you know, not a bad thing. Well today as you

6   all know job postings I'd like to say are

7   moving, but the truth is they largely have

8   moved from newspapers to online, obviously

9   creating real issues around newspapers - topic

10   for a separate conversation - but when you

11   think about it, you think about the fact that

12   classifieds have moved online, increasingly

13   companies are doing their job postings on

14   line. Increasingly companies are doing all of

15   their job postings online. Increasingly

16   companies are requiring applications for jobs

17   to be submitted online. So what a number of

18   years ago might have been an inconvenience

19   today is a serious disadvantage. If you're

20   looking for a job you need to have access to

21   the internet. Or think about children,

22   especially children in communities that have

```
 1    lower than average adoption rates.  We've all

 2    - well, I'll tell you my experience.  When I

 3    talk to school teachers, especially school

 4    teachers at public schools in urban areas or

 5    other areas with high populations of low-

 6    income students, here's what they say on a

 7    good day.  They say half my kids or less have

 8    broadband and the rest don't.  What am I

 9    supposed to do?  If I want to give out

10    homework assignments, research assignments

11    that get these kids familiar with the digital

12    tools they need to be participants in our

13    economy and participants in our democracy.  So

14    what am I supposed to do?  If I give out a

15    homework assignment, a research assignment

16    that relies on the internet the half of my

17    students or more who don't have internet

18    access, they're at a disadvantage.  At best

19    they have to scramble to find a library or

20    something where they can do it.  Tells you why

21    it's so important - I'll come back to e-Rate

22    in libraries and schools in a minute - but
```

1   they really, you know, they have to scramble

2   and sometimes they can't scramble enough and

3   they can't participate in those homework or

4   research assignments. And the teacher says

5   well, you know, I don't want to disadvantage

6   those kids, but if I don't give out

7   assignments that require digital tools and

8   skills I'm disadvantaging the kids who do have

9   broadband. And the truth is there is no

10   answer to this problem other than to tackle

11   the issues of digital inclusion very seriously

12   because we cannot continue to educate

13   generations of our kids who graduate from high

14   school without having the tools they need to

15   participate in a digital economy and in our

16   democracy.

17   So the plan as I hope you all saw

18   took this very seriously, included many

19   suggestions on how to tackle these issues. A

20   number of them came from suggestions we

21   received from the outside, including from the

22   Diversity Committee. A number of them came

1   from Commissioner Clyburn and my other

2   colleagues on the Commission. Just to

3   summarize some of them. The Broadband Plan,

4   by the way, is the gift that keeps on giving

5   and there's no attempt to summarize that can

6   capture everything.

7   (Laughter)

8   FCC CHAIRMAN GENACHOWSKI: But

9   I'll mention a few. One is the plan

10   recommends a once in a lifetime transformation

11   of the Universal Service Fund including

12   tackling Lifeline and Link-Up and making sure

13   that they work for broadband. This is the

14   kind of thing that we're excited about, needs

15   to be done, pleased that it's in the plan.

16   The plan has recommendations around e-Rate,

17   making sure that schools and libraries can

18   play the role they need to play. As you know

19   from what I said before, I don't think that's

20   enough. I think it's necessary but not

21   sufficient, but it is necessary. As many of

22   you know we've already made a down payment on

1   e-Rate 2.0 at the Commission meeting, when was

2   it, two months ago? Last month? Time flies.

3   We unanimously adopted a reform for e-Rate

4   that will allow schools to make their e-Rate

5   funded facilities available to the community,

6   and we hope schools take advantage of that

7   because we need our schools and libraries to

8   be public institutions where people can have

9   access where they don't have them at home.

10 The plan recommends the creation of a digital

11 literacy corps. Like other ideas in the plan,

12 this is modeled on successful ideas that have

13 started to work out in the communities. One

14 Economy is an example of an organization that

15 over the years has benefitted, they have their

16 digital connectors program. We think that a

17 real commitment to a digital literacy corps

18 focused on the communities that are lagging

19 behind in the United States will make a real

20 difference. Without getting into tremendous

21 detail the plan includes a series of

22 recommendations to try to tackle the tribal

 1   gap and we'll take those seriously in a series

 2   of ways. I won't do all the - Jeff knows all

 3   the recommendations and would be pleased to

 4   talk about that more.

 5   I do want to mention one other

 6   thing which I'm very pleased about. I think

 7   it's quite important and sometimes gets less

 8   attention. The affordability and literacy and

 9   relevance issues that as John Horrigan has

10   explained are what underlay the adoption gap

11   apply not only to ordinary consumers, but to

12   small businesses as well. We saw this at our

13   hearing in Chicago. We did a hearing on small

14   businesses and we received a lot of input on

15   this. We need to make sure that all of our

16   small businesses have a real opportunity to

17   participate in the opportunities of broadband.

18   The anecdotal information I think we've all

19   seen. We had, you know, whether it's Blue

20   Valley Meats in Diller, Nebraska, which

21   significantly increased its business and its

22   workforce by taking advantage of broadband, or

 1   Warren Love who is the founder of CakeLove

 2   here in D.C. For those of you who don't know,

 3   I really - I encourage you to pay attention

 4   the Warren Love CakeLove story. He

 5   participated in our hearings, he spoke at our

 6   small business - our SBA event. He has taken

 7   his business, started at 14th and U Street in

 8   Washington, D.C., expanded it from, you know,

 9   no stores to I believe seven stores now, from

10   zero employees to I believe 40 or 50 employees

11   in these last few years in difficult,

12   challenging economic times. And here's what

13   he said to us at one of the input events that

14   we did. He said I owe this expansion and the

15   success of this business to broadband. He

16   said I just realized that if I want to

17   succeed, if I want to grow a business, if I

18   want to create opportunity and hire people I

19   need to go to where the customers are and the

20   customers are online and they're on their

21   mobile phones. And he's doing really

22   innovative things, you know, very forward-

 1   looking in terms of using cloud computing to

 2   lower the operating cost of his business,

 3   using online marketing techniques to reach

 4   people where they are and it works. Well, he,

 5   you know, that's the exception, not the rule.

 6   Like so many other things that we're finding

 7   in the broadband area, we have to take things

 8   that are the exception and make them the rule.

 9   And many people who run small

10   businesses around the country in our urban

11   areas and our rural areas our work shows have

12   the same affordability, literacy, relevance

13   gaps as we see with ordinary consumers and so

14   there are a series of recommendations in the

15   Broadband Plan to tackle this. It's something

16   that Tom is really focused on. I think

17   they're very important. We're working on

18   public-private partnerships with the Small

19   Business Administration where we can channel

20   some government funding, bring together some

21   private companies to increase training for

22   small businesses in this area. There are a

 1   whole series of other small business issues

 2   that we're working on. Tom will catch you up

 3   on all of those.

 4   Let me briefly mention our

 5   consumer transparency issues which are also

 6   very important and I think will help with

 7   literacy, relevance, inclusion, helping people

 8   understand the - what's actually happening

 9   with broadband, see the benefits of it. I

10   won't talk at great length now about the

11   series of recommendations in the plan around

12   making sure that broadband is deployed to

13   promote our country's education goals and

14   healthcare goals and others. I see e-

15   government in general as a real opportunity.

16   Everyone wins if we can accelerate universal

17   broadband and accelerate the transition of

18   government from paper to electronic. You

19   know, the government can provide better

20   services to its citizens for less money,

21   helping our environment and our energy future

22   among other things, but here's the thing that

1   we learned as part of our Broadband Plan.

2   Until we achieve universal broadband

3   government has to maintain two

4   infrastructures. You know, so some people ask

5   - I don't see the Broadband Plan here, I meant

6   to bring it down - but some people ask why did

7   you publish this thing. And you know, and the

8   response is until everyone has broadband how

9   could we do a Broadband Plan that wasn't

10   available to people who didn't have broadband?

11   So of course it's online, we released it

12   online, it's in PDF, it's in HTML, it's

13   searchable, but there's a point here that I

14   would just point out to everyone, that

15   actually the FCC like other government

16   agencies have to maintain two infrastructures,

17   right? We have to do paper, we want to do

18   electronic and we will. Until everyone's in

19   universal broadband we have to spend more

20   money than we need to spend. The more we can

21   accelerate universal broadband the faster

22   government can provide better services to all

1   its citizens for less money, saving money that

2   really could be better deployed on a lot of

3   issues that this committee and others are

4   focused on. And so these issues around e-

5   government in addition to simply providing

6   better services to people also will help us

7   tackle some of the funding issues that we face

8   over time I believe.

9   Let me briefly touch on an issue

10   that I'm sure everyone in this room has been

11   thinking about and just make a point about it.

12   This is the spectrum recommendations in the

13   plan. You know, when - at the beginning of

14   the process I think when some people though

15   oh, you're going to do a Broadband Plan,

16   everyone assumed well this is a plan about

17   improving what happens when people plug their

18   computers into the wall and get wired

19   broadband. And of course we concluded that

20   that is not all we need to do, that obviously

21   we need to make sure that we have a world-

22   class wired infrastructure, but we also need

1   to make sure we have a world-class mobile

2   broadband infrastructure, a world-class

3   wireless infrastructure. It's an

4   extraordinary opportunity for the U.S. in the

5   decade and more ahead for real job creation,

6   for real small business creation, for real

7   opportunity and it's an area where we have the

8   opportunity to lead the world, but we also

9   have identifiable risks if we don't tackle it.

10   I think if we do it right it can be an engine

11   for job creation, broad opportunity, as strong

12   as anything we've ever had in the country, and

13   if we get it wrong we'll be wondering why

14   leading mobile innovation companies are

15   starting their businesses across the Atlantic

16   or across the Pacific.

17   Now, one of the recommendations in

18   the plan coming out of the record that we

19   developed involved looking at broadcast

20   spectrum and thinking creatively about how we

21   can have a win-win around the spectrum to free

22   up spectrum for mobile broadband and also

1   preserve free over-the-air broadcasting for

2   viewers. And I understand and I am more than

3   sympathetic with the diversity concerns that

4   this could raise. It is, you know, not

5   desirable to reduce the number of voices that

6   we have in markets, and broadcast TV stations

7   obviously play an important role. What I

8   think can be a real win-win for everyone in

9   this area is to look at the opportunities that

10   can come out of broadcast spectrum sharing, a

11   reduction in operating costs and capital

12   infusions that can come out of the incentive

13   auctions that we've suggested. And if a small

14   number of TV stations in a small number of

15   markets share 6mhz channels, they don't go off

16   the air, but they share, we can free up a

17   tremendous amount of spectrum for mobile

18   broadband and all the economic and social

19   opportunities that would create. In so doing,

20   that could provide broadcasters the

21   opportunity to reduce operating costs and as

22   we work to structure an incentive auction,

 1   generate capital which of course is so sorely

 2   needed. And so this is something that I hope

 3   we can work on together. I think - I would

 4   encourage everyone involved to look at this

 5   issue from all sides and to work with us on a

 6   real win-win that promotes our mobile

 7   broadband future, we all share an interest in

 8   that, and also looks at how we can meet some

 9   of the challenges and preserve diversity of

10   voices in the broadcast area. You know, call

11   me a bright-eyed optimist, but I do believe

12   there is an opportunity here for a real win-

13   win that works for everyone, and what I would

14   ask everyone to do is work with us, roll up

15   your sleeves and look at all the different

16   ways that this can be structured that really

17   works for the country.

18   I think we have an opportunity and

19   I hope we can work together on seizing it.

20   There are of course many other issues that I

21   haven't touched on. I know I've gone on way

22   too long and I suspect that there are people

 1   upstairs who are very angry that I'm still

 2   down here. I'm glad that Tom is here. I know

 3   he'll speak with you. I'm thrilled that

 4   Commissioner Clyburn has taken the time to be

 5   here as well. So let me stop there. Thank

 6   you again for the important work that you do

 7   on this committee and in providing your input

 8   and advice to the Commission. We appreciate

 9   it very much and with that, Commissioner

10   Clyburn I cede the microphone to you.

11   (Applause)

12   COMMISSIONER CLYBURN: Before you

13   leave, Mr. Chairman, first of all - oh, okay.

14   My pleasure. I want to thank you for a whole

15   host of things. Thank you for your

16   friendship, for your advice, for listening to

17   this person who seems to always brag about

18   being a very southern person, very outside-

19   the-Beltway, but I really sincerely want to

20   thank you for even the ideas where you can

21   tell that I'm pulling them from all sorts of

22   places that I can't even define. You at least

1 listen and pretend that all of my ideas are

2 sound.

3   (Laughter)

4   COMMISSIONER CLYBURN: But I want

5 to say to you that, you know, the Chairman has

6 touched on many things and I don't think I

7 have anything left to say, but we will be best

8 friends for life let me say in front of all

9 these witnesses if you were to continue that

10 tomorrow when we're in front of that committee

11 so that - and maybe I can get out of there and

12 feel okay.

13   But I want to thank all of you. I

14 know for many of you this has been a long

15 journey. For many of you you might have

16 questioned at least for a minute, you know,

17 why. Why do I stay committed to this when

18 maybe I haven't been listened to as much. Why

19 do I stay committed to this when maybe you

20 don't see the types of change that you expect.

21 But I think in listening to the Chairman and

22 seeing the direction in which we are headed at

 1   this agency you will not have another moment

 2   of why. You've got five individuals who are

 3   willing to listen, who get along most days,

 4   right? But who recognize that we can no

 5   longer do things in the same way. You've

 6   brought that forth. I love what you said

 7   "making the exception the rule." I think

 8   those are words that if we truly embrace in

 9   their fullest context that again we will never

10   ask why we are here involved in these critical

11   issues and involved in making this

12   communications space more robust and more

13   inclusive for all Americans. You can rest

14   assured that we are actively involved at every

15   level of this agency in reviewing the

16   recommendations that you've put forth.

17   As the Chairman mentioned - and

18   thank you - we worked with his office closely

19   and with Tom Reed to take a look at every

20   single recommendation you've had to date. I'm

21   going to ask a couple of things of you. Many

22   of the recommendations that you put forth kind

1   of met us here. They were here long before

2   they even heard of a Mignon Clyburn. Well,

3   they've might have heard of Julius.

4   (Laughter)

5   COMMISSIONER CLYBURN: So you

6   know, quite frankly and honestly we've got a

7   lot of catching up to do. And in addition to

8   that, I think there are seven or eight

9   recommendations that have been circulated

10   since we've been here. I anticipate, and the

11   Chairman has brought forth that too, that

12   we're going to move on many of those

13   recommendations. But there are a number of

14   those that might need to be tweaked, might

15   need to be discussed a bit further, and for

16   various reasons may not be doable at this

17   time, but that in no way is a negative

18   reflection on our commitment to this committee

19   and our commitment to diversity. I see our

20   efforts with respect to diversity as a team

21   effort, and I look forward to continued

22   collaboration. If there are any issues that

```
 1    you find with respect to process I encourage

 2    you to let me know, I encourage you to let the

 3    Chairman know, and all of us know because

 4    we're your partners in all of this.  So with

 5    that engagement and with that dialogue any

 6    concerns that you have I think can be

 7    resolved.  So again, I think the Chairman

 8    basically said everything that I would have

 9    said and plus everything that he's supposed to

10    say, but I want to affirm to you that you have

11    a partner.  You not only have a partner, you

12    have a friend and I'm looking forward to the

13    next few months and the next years, at least

14    for me, the next two and a half or so years,

15    where we're going to make incredible changes

16    in this country, and again, we'll never, never

17    ask why.  Thank you.

18              (Applause)

19              FCC CHAIRMAN GENACHOWSKI:  Thank

20    you, everyone.

21              CHAIRMAN RIVERA:  Thank you both

22    for being here.  It really meant a lot to all
```

 1   of us to have you here and to hear your words

 2   of encouragement. Thanks so much. All right.

 3   Jane, thank you for -

 4   MS. MAGO: I was in mid-sentence.

 5   (Laughter)

 6   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Yes, I know you

 7   were.

 8   MS. MAGO: As I was saying - but I

 9   digress. No, back to the report. As the

10   Chairman indicated I think in his remarks so

11   eloquently, one of the key areas for

12   recruiting is in the internet. And so we're

13   pleased that one of the recommendations that

14   we have here is to have the Commission

15   recognize internet recruitment as one of the

16   checklists of recruitment options for

17   complying with the EEO plan in the broadcast

18   arena, and we think that that's something

19   that's very important. He also touched on I

20   think a little bit the other recommendation

21   that we have which is to ask the agency to

22   look at a rulemaking proceeding that would

 1   look at how you apply EEO rules across all of

 2   the platforms. I think we as a group have

 3   talked a number of times about that it's not

 4   just about broadcasting, or it's not just

 5   about the telecom area, but rather EEO is an

 6   important aspect of all of the businesses.

 7   And while the Commission recognizes on a broad

 8   level that there's EEO across - requirements

 9   that go across all of the businesses, it

10   really is always focused on broadcasting and

11   has most specific rules when it comes to the

12   broadcasting arena. So one of our

13   recommendations was to look at a rulemaking

14   that would look across all of the various

15   platforms, especially as we now converge more

16   and more and consider how that important goal

17   should be applied across platforms.

18   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: All right, thank

19   you Jane. So, the chair will take as a motion

20   the first recommendations - we'll break them

21   up so we can discuss them intelligently if we

22   need to do that - on internet-based

1   recruiting. Is there a second to that? Yes,

2   all right. Is there any discussion?

3   (No response)

4   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: All right. All

5   those in favor say "Aye."

6   (Chorus of ayes)

7   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Opposed?

8   (No response)

9   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Motion carries.

10   Second recommendation is the apprenticeship of

11   EEO rules - or the recommendation actually

12   would be for the Commission to institute a

13   rulemaking to apply EEO rules across

14   platforms. The chair will take that as a

15   motion from the committee. Is there a second?

16   Discussion?

17   (No response)

18   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: All those in

19   favor say "Aye."

20   (Chorus of ayes)

21   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Opposed?

22   (No response)

1   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Motion carries.

2   Thank you, Jane. Diane?

3   MS. SUTTER: Thank you. The

4   Funding for Acquisitions task force has been

5   very busy not only with making recommendations

6   but following up on them. We appreciate the

7   Chairman as well as the commissioners' support

8   for the recommendations that have been made

9   and toward that effort the chair of the task

10   force which is Susan Patrick and I had an

11   opportunity to spend time with Carolyn

12   Williams and Tom Reed to really meet with them

13   since most of the recommendations we made get

14   sent to them to implement. We met with them

15   to sit down and talk about the recommendations

16   we had made in December, what had happened

17   with those and how we might support their

18   office in making them a reality. We were

19   really thrilled that they gave us a great deal

20   of time, they were very receptive to our

21   discussion and I think we have identified ways

22   that we can - especially as it comes to

1   funding for acquisitions for small and medium

2   and smaller deals that we can actually get an

3   educational process started for lending

4   institutions whereby they understand more

5   lending to this.

6   And we are looking at the FCC

7   website. We had conversations about the

8   relaunch of the FCC website and we have since

9   that time supplied them with some examples of

10   the materials that we think could be used as

11   possible inclusion on the website that talk

12   about how to lend to broadcast, the nuances of

13   it and how to be successful in doing that. So

14   we're hoping to continue that relationship and

15   to keep moving toward that.

16   The second aspect with the

17   implementation of working with the other

18   agencies, I think you heard the Chairman

19   reflect that that's an issue for them. Also

20   we've been talking with them about how we

21   might coordinate with that. And in the

22   process we have also talked about TDF and the

1   question that has been raised by the budget

2   process as to whether or not it will be

3   renewed. You may know that that is probably

4   the only official opportunity for funding that

5   exists within the sector right now

6   specifically for telecom and the inclusion of

7   broadcast. It was budgeted for potential

8   elimination. We had conversations with both

9   Tom and Carolyn about whether or not that

10   might be something that we should look at.

11   That is funded by auctions. As you know,

12   there have not been any auctions recently,

13   hence the funding is severely limited. Of the

14   $80 million that they originally had they have

15   less than $2 that has not yet been deployed,

16   but they have a number of companies that they

17   are currently working with that are still in

18   the process. So if it were to be eliminated,

19   then the question of how those companies would

20   be handled going forth is still an issue.

21   We had a conference call that took

22   place with Jim Pastoriza and he of course

1   talked about what his plans are for TDF and

2   how we might work with them going forward.

3   And as a result we have a recommendation that

4   the Advisory Committee on Diversity recommends

5   that the Commission adopt a legislative

6   recommendation to urge that the U.S. Congress

7   continue to authorize and re-calibrate the

8   Telecommunications Development Fund to focus

9   on access to capital for historically

10   disadvantaged populations and to diversify the

11   products, deal sizes and industries to which

12   TDF provides financial support. In re-

13   calibrating the fund, we suggested ways in

14   which they might focus on access to capital

15   for historically disadvantaged populations,

16   for example, providing greater service to

17   minority and women through race-neutral full-

18   file review of applicants. Diversify the

19   products by offering a balanced portfolio of

20   loans, grants, equity investments and

21   educational services, diversifying the deal

22   size by providing micro loans and

 1   participating in larger deals by providing

 2   mezzanine financing. Traditionally they have

 3   been more focused on equity in terms of what

 4   they've provided. Diversifying the scope of

 5   the industries in which it participates by

 6   investing in the many sub-fields of

 7   telecommunications such as a greater focus on

 8   broadcasting and cable.

 9   The fund itself has done 12 to 14

10   loans, most of which have been in the telecom

11   space and the recommendations of this task

12   force to the full committee are that

13   broadening the focus of the committee - of the

14   fund as well as how it invests its money and

15   where it invests its money might also provide

16   for greater opportunities in other industries

17   besides the one that it has mainly focused on.

18   So that is the recommendation of the

19   committee.

20   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: All right, the

21   chairman will take that as a motion. Is there

22   a second? All right. So the motion is

1   basically to try to save the TDF. It's been

2   zeroed out of the budget so that's what we

3   will be voting on. Is there any discussion on

4   this motion?

5   (No response)

6   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: All right, all

7   in favor say "Aye."

8   (Chorus of ayes)

9   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Opposed?

10   (No response)

11   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Motion carries.

12   Thank you very much Diane and congratulations

13   to you and your subcommittee chairs, your task

14   force chairs. Really a good body of work

15   here. Thanks so much.

16   MS. SUTTER: I would also like to

17   thank the subcommittees, the task forces.

18   They have worked in each of their areas, had

19   meetings beyond and done a lot of work to try

20   and bring this committee these

21   recommendations. So thank you.

22   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Thanks so much.

 1   As Barbara said this is the last year of our

 2   charter. Could be that the chairman will re-

 3   charter this available committee. I hope that

 4   he does, but we've got a limited amount of

 5   time to get cracking here so I'm hoping that

 6   we hear from all the subcommittees at our next

 7   meeting which will be sometime in June.

 8   Barbara and I will caucus and find out when a

 9   good time would be for us to get together.

10   But you can plan on a June timeframe for those

11   of you working on additional recommendations

12   to come forward. So now we will move into our

13   reports and I'd like to call on Tom Reed who

14   heads up the OCBO to tell us what's going on

15   down there.

16   MR. REED: Thank you. Good

17   afternoon everybody. First of all, I'd like

18   to thank Henry for inviting me here to report

19   to you here today. I'm going to try and keep

20   my comments brief. I'd like to thank the

21   chairman, Chairman Genachowski and

22   Commissioner Clyburn for their remarks. In

 1   fact, I want to take this opportunity to thank

 2   all of the commissioners because they have

 3   provided OCBO with unwavering support and I

 4   think all of you here know that without that

 5   kind of support the office really can't do

 6   what it's been chartered to do. So that's

 7   been really encouraging for me and my staff,

 8   and it has sort of increased our ability to do

 9   our job. But just to let you know what we've

10   been up to probably in the last few months,

11   since the last committee meeting. You know,

12   fortunately Chairman Genachowski, you know,

13   it's nice when your boss does some of your

14   work for you. He mentioned a lot of things

15   that we've been up to with the Broadband Plan

16   and Diane has mentioned the work that we've

17   been doing with the Media Issues subcommittee

18   and sort of advancing some of those

19   recommendations. As I think I mentioned to

20   Diane and Susan, with respect to the Media

21   Issues subcommittee the educational component

22   that they're discussing you know obviously is

 1   something that we're very excited about and we

 2   are in the process now. We've gotten the

 3   materials that Diane and Susan sent to us.

 4   We're going to be reviewing those. We have

 5   had - I've had a conversation with Austin

 6   Schlick. The only issue with respect to

 7   materials that we would put on our website

 8   would just be vetting them internally because

 9   they're materials that tacitly we would be

10   endorsing. So that's not going to be a

11   problem I don't think. So the chairman

12   mentioned Steve VanRoekel and this was in

13   connection with this issue, Steve VanRoekel

14   who is the head of the Office of the Managing

15   Director. He is in the process of revamping

16   the FCC's website which I think everybody here

17   knows needs a lot of work. We are also in the

18   process of redesigning our own portion of that

19   website and so we are excited that we want to

20   be able to provide sort of the educational

21   materials, not just with respect to lending to

22   broadcast properties, but all issues that are

 1   relevant to our constituent groups so that

 2   there can be one central repository of

 3   academic materials and instruction materials

 4   that will be helpful to small businesses and

 5   diverse businesses. So that's something that

 6   we've been working on.

 7   Chairman Genachowski mentioned the

 8   work that we've been doing with the broadband

 9   team, and I won't go into detail about that,

10   but I will say one of the issues that - a

11   couple of the issues that we focused most on

12   with respect to the National Broadband Plan

13   was to make sure that with respect to economic

14   opportunities that our recommendations put a

15   lot of emphasis on digital literacy and

16   training for small businesses, and making sure

17   that a lot of that would be done through SBA

18   since they are branded, small businesses

19   recognize who they are, they recognize the

20   small business development centers, and we

21   wanted to make sure that the instruction and

22   the guidance through the National Broadband

1   Plan went through SBA and then secondarily

2   through the Entrepreneurial Development Agency

3   so that the kind of mentoring and guidance

4   that small businesses require when you're

5   dealing with new technology and new media,

6   that they would have at their disposal. So

7   that - those are some of the issues that we

8   focused on most in dealing with the National

9   Broadband Plan.

10   We have been hard at work with,

11   you know, the Constitutional Issues

12   subcommittee. I'd like to thank David for all

13   of his hard work and his team. I know Joe

14   Miller is here and Jackie, I don't see her

15   here, but I don't know if you all see that

16   huge binder that David has in front of him.

17   The pending issues that are before the

18   Commission that have been - that Commissioner

19   Clyburn alluded to, that have been weighing

20   heavily on the Commission for decades, and

21   some of them more recently. David and his

22   team were good enough and kind enough to put

 1   together a lot of intelligence for us as we

 2   excavate each one of these issues. We're

 3   going through them one at a time and my staff

 4   has been very committed to going through each

 5   of these recommendations so that we get as

 6   much intelligence as possible so that we can

 7   make meaningful progress. The chairman and

 8   all the commissioners are very committed to

 9   making progress on all of these issues. So

10   David and his team met with us for two long

11   sessions as we went through each one so that

12   we can be most informed as we go to each of

13   the bureaus and offices. Barbara knows we had

14   met with the Media Bureau to talk about a

15   number of the issues, finding out which ones

16   have just been languishing, you know. Those

17   where there in principle isn't - there isn't

18   real opposition to them, but they've been

19   languishing procedurally. We want to identify

20   those. Those where there are sticking points,

21   we want to clarify what those points are to

22   determine whether or not we can redirect or

 1   find a position that's going to be more

 2   viable, and then identifying those that either

 3   are docketed or moot so that we can move

 4   forward and get the kind of work done I think

 5   that this committee believes in and that OCBO

 6   definitely believes in. So we've made a

 7   tremendous amount of progress there.

 8   Before I close I wanted to mention

 9   one - there's one workshop that we did I think

10   that we hadn't done at the time that we had -

11   that this committee met last, and that's the -

12   we did at the tail end of January a round

13   table discussion. Jim was a part of that and

14   Jeff was a part of that. We did a round table

15   discussion which sort of changed gears a

16   little bit in terms of how the other workshops

17   were done on broadband. It dealt with

18   minority radio and finding or discussing

19   digital and new media strategies for minority

20   radio. Carolyn did a tremendous job

21   moderating that panel and did a great job

22   putting that group together so I'd like to

 1   commend her and the OCBO staff that put that

 2   discussion group together. It's the beginning

 3   of discussion. We intend and are committed to

 4   doing that on a regular basis because

 5   obviously we aren't going to find all the

 6   solutions in one 2-hour session. But we think

 7   it's necessary in addition to finding a lot of

 8   the solutions that we need to find for small

 9   and minority radio we are looking for new

10   solutions with respect to those entities

11   because it's extremely important. And that

12   discussion group acknowledged how important

13   and essential minority radio continues to be,

14   and given the current economic state what we

15   need to do to give them as much assistance as

16   possible. So I look forward to having more

17   conversations, bringing more experts in to

18   talk about what solutions we need to be

19   looking at. So that was one of our sessions

20   I think that received just the most attention

21   and people were most excited about. So we

22   look forward to doing that again.

1   And I think with that Diane

2   covered most of what we were doing with that

3   group so I don't think I have to repeat that,

4   but that's essentially what we've been up to.

5   I would like to say for all the subcommittees

6   I hope you know by now our door is open. We

7   welcome, not just welcome, we encourage our

8   expertise and your help. I mean, we really do

9   need it and I think it's one of the ways that

10   we can move forward very quickly on some of

11   the issues that are before this committee. So

12   thank you.

13   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Thank you, Tom.

14   We're very pleased that you're engaged as you

15   are with these issues and in particular I

16   think the notion of your going through these

17   84 recommendations is very exciting. We need

18   somebody to do that and we're glad that you

19   got the call. And thank you, David, for all

20   the work that you've been putting in to try to

21   move that along. Again, I think it's just

22   terribly exciting and we need to - it needs to

1   be done. So, and we're glad the Chairman is

2   committed to moving these things along as

3   well. So, are there any questions for Tom?

4   I certainly would echo his plea basically to

5   the subcommittees to make use of OCBO because

6   the Chairman has dedicated them as the point

7   person to work with our committee and he's, as

8   he said, ready, willing and able to do that.

9   So if you need some help, Tom's the guy.

10   All right. Let's move on then to

11   our report from John Horrigan. Thank you for

12   being here, John. Who's going to talk to us

13   about broadband adoption and use in America.

14   The Chairman referenced his study and

15   presentation in his remarks so we're anxious

16   to hear and see it. John, thank you.

17   MR. HORRIGAN: Thank you very

18   much. It's a pleasure to be here. What I

19   want to do today is go through some of the

20   findings from the white paper that the FCC

21   released prior to the Broadband Plan called

22   Broadband Adoption and Use in America. We

 1   undertook this white paper based on a survey

 2   that we conducted in October/November of last

 3   year, and the survey itself was key inputs

 4   into formulating the recommendations in the

 5   Broadband Plan for adoption. So what I'm

 6   going to do is go through the slides. The

 7   slides themselves have more detail than I'm

 8   going to touch on today so I'll probably be

 9   saying to the people in the AV room "next

10   slide" quite often. But there's extra detail

11   there for you if you want it and I'm going to

12   try to get through them so that we can have a

13   discussion or I can entertain any questions.

14   I have a question already. Karen?

15   MS. NARASAKI: Yes, thank you. I

16   noted with interest some of the breakout data

17   for African-Americans and Latinos, and I was

18   wondering what data there was from Asian-

19   Americans in this.

20   MR. HORRIGAN: Good question and

21   sort of in the spirit of getting the slide

22   show going I'll ask that we go to the second

1   slide that talks a little bit about what I

2   want to accomplish today. Then I'll ask that

3   we advance to slide number 3 that talks about

4   the sample. We conducted a national random

5   dial telephone survey. Let's skip ahead one

6   slide further. I'm sorry, go back two slides.

7   That slide, yes. There's the slide that

8   describes the nature of the sample. We

9   conducted a national random- digit dial

10   telephone survey of 5,005 Americans. For a

11   national survey that's actually a very large

12   number of respondents. However, even with

13   that large number of respondents you get a

14   small number of Asian-Americans, of Native

15   Americans in the sample which means it's

16   difficult to say anything with statistical

17   certainty. So the questions that asks

18   respondents about their racial or national

19   origin did include questions about whether the

20   respondent's Asian-American or Native

21   American, and we tabulated that. However,

22   there were probably when you include both

 1   Asian-Americans, Native Americans and others

 2   just 120 or so respondents in those several

 3   categories which is too small for making

 4   statistical inferences, and so for that reason

 5   we don't report that. For those kinds of sub-

 6   populations, the Asian-American population,

 7   the NTIA's Census-based survey which was also

 8   conducted in October is really the gold

 9   standard for basic adoption numbers among

10   those communities. So they're included yet

11   not reported because of reasons about small

12   sample size.

13   MS. NARASAKI: And do you have any

14   plan to follow up? Because this is an issue

15   we often have and part of it is designing the

16   study so that you do an over-sample so you can

17   get the numbers so you can have statistically

18   significant data. It's just very hard when

19   you're telling me that you're basing your

20   National Broadband Plan on this data and then

21   the data for two communities, particularly the

22   Native American community which is very under-

1 served, is not there.

2   MR. HORRIGAN: In the Broadband

3 Plan we do make some recommendations for

4 additional research work to get at sub-

5 populations for the very reason that you touch

6 on. So in the plan we do recommend that that

7 kind of work be done going forward, and we

8 hope to be able to do it going forward. Thank

9 you.   MS. MAGO: Can you give

10 us a cite to the NTIA study that you mentioned

11 too?

12   MR. HORRIGAN: I believe it's -

13 Toni has the -

14   MS. BUSH: I can circulate it.

15   MS. MAGO: Thanks.

16   MR. HORRIGAN: It was released in

17 early February. It should be front and center

18 on the NTIA web page, but worth looking at.

19 I should say also, a difference between the

20 survey and I'm going to talk about and the

21 NTIA survey is that this survey is a survey

22 that was dedicated entirely to broadband

 1   adoption and reasons for non-adoption. So the

 2   respondents got questions only on the issue of

 3   broadband and some other related services.

 4   The NTIA study only goes into it based out of

 5   questions about who has broadband and who

 6   doesn't. In 2012 I believe the American

 7   Community Survey will have some additional

 8   questions on broadband use that means that

 9   from a Census-based survey with a very large

10   sample size the ability to go to sub-

11   populations, there will be questions not only

12   about adoption, but some additional questions

13   I believe that can get at some of the more

14   textured issues surrounding information

15   technology. So that's something coming down

16   the line in a year or two that's very

17   important.

18   So back to the survey that we

19   conducted this past October. That's the slide

20   currently before you, the slide labeled number

21   3 in your packet. You can get a sense of the

22   sample size. We over-sampled non-adopters so

1   we had just over 2,300 non-adopters which

2   helps greatly in understanding the texture

3   surrounding non-adoption for statistical

4   purposes. For a lot of national surveys that

5   you'll read about online the number of

6   respondents for the entire survey will often

7   be less than 2,300 people. So we consider

8   ourselves very fortunate to have had the

9   resources to do an over-sample of non-adopters

10   to get a sample size for the third of the

11   country that does not have broadband that

12   exceeds the sample size for a lot of national

13   surveys that you read about. The survey did

14   have a Spanish-speaking option in it and it

15   included cell phones in the sample.

16   Increasingly today since a lot of people have

17   cell phones only at home you need to have cell

18   phone numbers in your sample to get a truly

19   representative sample. Next slide. Next

20   slide, please.

21   This slide just gives a high-level

22   snapshot of the results. We found that a

 1   little more than three-quarters of Americans

 2   are internet users, two-thirds with broadband

 3   at home and 65 percent of Americans with

 4   broadband at home. So that 2 percentage point

 5   discrepancy between households and number of

 6   Americans using broadband comes from this.

 7   When we conducted the survey we asked people

 8   whether they have broadband or not. Some

 9   people said no, I don't have broadband. We

10   followed up with questions in the survey

11   asking if there's somebody else in the

12   household who uses the internet. Some people

13   said yes. Another follow-up question asked

14   does that person go online in your house with

15   broadband. Some people said yes. So that 2

16   percentage points represents the yes answers

17   to those two questions, the people who weren't

18   internet users themselves yet lived in a

19   household in which there was at least one

20   other broadband-using person.

21   The survey also found that 86

22   percent of Americans have a cell phone and

 1   about 30 percent of Americans have used the

 2   internet on a handheld. Now, that's different

 3   than mobile broadband, but it's worth pointing

 4   out that, as most of us in this room know,

 5   people do go online with their handhelds.

 6   When you drill into that data a little bit you

 7   find that among people who don't have

 8   broadband at home, 14 percent have accessed

 9   the internet on their cell phone. So there's

10   a small incidence of people accessing the

11   internet on a handheld even though they don't

12   have broadband at home, but the overall

13   findings point to the fact that mobile

14   internet access is basically a supplementary

15   way of getting online for people, not a

16   substitute for the wire line connection.

17   MR. SCHWARTZMAN: Where do the

18   people who have access to broadband at school

19   or at work but not at home come in? Because

20   you've got 67 percent are broadband users so

21   they may be using it outside of the home and

22   then 65 percent at home.

 1   MR. HORRIGAN: We'll get to that

 2   several slides down, but when you start to

 3   carve out the 35 percent of people without

 4   broadband at home we have 22 percent who are

 5   non-users, 6 percent are dial-up and then 6

 6   percent are people who have internet access

 7   from someplace other than home. So they could

 8   be - typically you're talking about people who

 9   go online mainly at the library. There's a

10   small number of people in there who don't have

11   access at home but just use the internet at

12   work. So that's how the baskets of non-

13   adoption sort out and we'll be getting to that

14   in some detail a little bit later on. Next

15   slide, please.

16   This slide shows just at a broad

17   level where the big dividing lines are in

18   terms of broadband access. So really

19   education and income are the big dividing

20   lines on broadband access. For both the

21   education and income bars that you see before

22   you on this slide, particularly for education,

1   about half of adult Americans are people with

2   a high school degree or less, about half of

3   Americans have at least some experience with

4   college even if they haven't graduated, and

5   you can see the huge discrepancies in

6   broadband adoption rates there: 46 percent for

7   people who are high school graduates or less,

8   82 percent for people who have had at least

9   some college experience. Similarly for

10   income, those living in households with annual

11   incomes below $50,000, just about half have

12   broadband at home compared with people who are

13   better off economically in households with

14   $50k or more per year income, 87 percent have

15   broadband. And then you can see age is a big

16   dividing line as well. Senior citizens are

17   about half as likely as average to have

18   broadband at home. Next slide, please.

19   This slide just provides a lot

20   more granularity in terms of sorting out

21   broadband adoption rates across different

22   categories. And I'll call your attention to

1   the set of bars on the far right which shows

2   differences among white Americans, African-

3   Americans and Hispanics. So against the

4   overall national average of 65 percent you can

5   see that 59 percent of African-Americans have

6   broadband at home and 49 percent of Hispanics.

7   That actually - when you compare that with

8   data from the Pew Internet Project represents

9   a decent growth rate for both African-

10   Americans and Hispanics relative to the prior

11   years. I think when I was at Pew our April

12   2009 numbers showed that 46 percent of

13   African-Americans have broadband and 40

14   percent of Hispanics. So those numbers do

15   represent decent increases, although obviously

16   they still lag the national average. I'll

17   call your attention also to the rural/non-

18   rural breakout. You can see that largely

19   because of lack of available infrastructure

20   rural Americans lag the national average

21   considerably with respect to broadband

22   adoption.

1   Turning next to slide number 8, we

2   did ask in this survey how much people pay per

3   month for broadband and there's a lot of

4   detail in this particular slide, but the key

5   takeaway is that people spent about $41 per

6   month for broadband. A lot of the other data

7   simply indicates that if you do some different

8   - if you rely on different sources with

9   different methods of collecting data on how

10   much people pay per month for broadband the

11   results are by and large the same. When you

12   look at some trend data, the data shows that

13   that $41 per month number for broadband really

14   hasn't changed too much over the past several

15   years so prices have been generally steady for

16   consumers in getting broadband at home.

17   MR. WARFIELD: Going back to Slide

18   6. When you look at age, is there any data

19   that indicates how much of a factor income

20   plays with that 65 and older group?

21   MR. HORRIGAN: Yes. When you

22   start to dig into the data, which is what I do

1   a lot of, there's obviously a correlation

2   between age and lower income levels. Older

3   Americans on average have lower incomes than

4   younger Americans. But when you start to sort

5   through some of the analysis, age is clearly

6   an independent factor associated with lower

7   broadband adoption rates. Income in terms of

8   overall magnitude of effect is a bigger deal

9   than age, but both matter a great deal with

10   respect to lower broadband adoption rates.

11   When we start to talk about reasons for non-

12   adoption I'll talk a little bit about the

13   reasons for older Americans. For older

14   Americans sort of possibly counter-intuitive

15   given what I just said. Older Americans are

16   less likely to cite cost as a barrier and much

17   more likely to cite reasons pertaining to

18   digital skills or not knowing about relevant

19   content online. Andrew?

20   MR. SCHWARTZMAN: Did you have a

21   significant number of people because of the

22   bundling report that they didn't know how much

1   they were paying?

2   MR. HORRIGAN: Yes. Half of

3   bundlers did not know what they were paying

4   per month when we asked them specifically,

5   "Can you tell me what the internet portion of

6   your bundled bill?" Half of bundlers said

7   they couldn't specify. So that average number

8   that I reported excludes those people from

9   whom we could not get an answer. Karen?

10   MS. NARASAKI: Yes. Do you have a

11   sense of how independent race is from

12   education and economic status?

13   MR. HORRIGAN: For both African-

14   Americans and Hispanics the effects are

15   statistically significant, but not that big.

16   So it's more of a story of income or

17   education. Whatever cultural factors may be

18   associated with the significance on the

19   African-American or Hispanic variables just

20   isn't a large impact.

21   Let's move on to - we're going to

22   skip through Slides 9, 10, 11 and we're going

 1   to go to 12 which gets us to non-adoption.

 2   It's not to say that the data on those other

 3   slides was not important. We actually in the

 4   survey asked lots of questions about what

 5   people do with their broadband internet

 6   connections and what they value about being

 7   connected online, and I would recommend you

 8   look at that and I'm available by email if you

 9   have any questions specifically about that,

10   but I thought in the interest of time we'd

11   move to non-adoption. And let's then move to

12   Slide 13 and goes right to the question Andy

13   asked earlier: what's the nature of non-

14   adoption. And as I said before, when you

15   focus on the 35 percent of Americans who don't

16   have broadband at home, 22 percent of all

17   Americans are non-internet users, 6 percent

18   still have dial-up at home, 6 percent going

19   online from somewhere other than home, at

20   work. We asked people about whether they have

21   broadband infrastructure where they live.

22   Four percent said that they do not have

 1   broadband where they live in - this was data

 2   gleaned from the survey. The deployment team

 3   for the Broadband Plan using different

 4   methodology to try to figure out where

 5   infrastructure is and where infrastructure

 6   isn't actually converged on about the same

 7   number of Americans saying they don't have

 8   broadband where they live. Our deployment

 9   guys find that 5 percent of Americans don't

10   have broadband where they live. The survey

11   finds that 4 percent say they don't have

12   broadband where they live. All of this is by

13   way of saying that for the most part the non-

14   adoption problem is not about infrastructure

15   availability, it's about something else.

16   Roughly 31 percent of Americans do not have

17   broadband because for some reason they choose

18   not to get it, but that reason does not

19   include lack of available infrastructure.

20   MS. MAGO: John, just curious in

21   terms of people self-reporting whether they

22   have access to broadband, how did you drill

 1   down to ask that question in terms of -

 2   someone can understand they've got dial-up

 3   service versus DSL or something like that, but

 4   if they - how did you determine whether they

 5   had access to it?

 6   MR. HORRIGAN: It's a good

 7   question. It's simply self-reporting. People

 8   were permitted in the survey to select from a

 9   menu of different possible reasons why they

10   don't have broadband: cost, lack of skill,

11   lack of interest and one box that they could

12   effectively check is it's not available where

13   I live. Now, from a survey design perspective

14   you don't want to ask too many questions in a

15   survey that ask people to try to figure out

16   what's going on with infrastructure in their

17   neighborhood. Not the best technique to use,

18   or rather overuse in a survey because quite

19   obviously they could be incorrect about that.

20   They're much more likely to be correct on a

21   whole other set of questions about things they

22   face on a daily basis. But it's a question we

1   have to ask since it's a legitimate reason for

2   not having broadband and it isn't a perfect

3   measure, but it's not half bad either in that

4   it converges with what our deployment team

5   found as well.

6   MR. WINSTON: Excuse me, John.

7   When you were doing the survey, did you find

8   some people didn't even know what you were

9   asking them when you asked about broadband?

10   Did you have to define it in some way for

11   them?

12   MR. HORRIGAN: That's another good

13   question. And we had to take up some space on

14   the survey to really get to a reliable or what

15   we felt was a reliable measure of whether

16   somebody has broadband at home or not. So we

17   asked people off of a list of different types

18   of connections you could have to tell us do

19   you have this at home to get online. So do

20   you have a cable modem, do you have DSL, do

21   you have fiberoptic, do you have wireless. So

22   they could actually check more than one box.

 1   And I'm using "checking the box" figuratively

 2   since this was done on the phone. And as it

 3   happens people don't really know with much

 4   specificity what their broadband connection is

 5   at home. People check multiples boxes when

 6   it's probably not the case that they have DSL

 7   and a cable modem, yet for a bunch of reasons

 8   not least of which is Census encouraged us to

 9   use the question they used, we employed this

10   technique because it's an imperfect way to get

11   at whether somebody has broadband, but all the

12   other ways are even more imperfect. So we

13   asked them to list from the menu which types

14   of broadband connections they had. Then we

15   asked them - including dial-up. Then we asked

16   them do you go online with a slow speed

17   connection like dial-up or something else, and

18   we got an answer to that. Then we asked them

19   again, just to confirm, is your current

20   internet connection a dial-up internet

21   connection at home or not. And that sort of

22   stripped away false positives on that and got

1   us to the 6 percent number that I cited for

2   dial-up at home with everybody else being

3   classified as having broadband. Again, it's

4   perhaps not a perfect way to go about it,

5   ideally you could look at their bill, or look

6   over their shoulder, but we can't do that in

7   a survey, yet we feel like it hones in on the

8   people who have dial-up and we feel like

9   people understand whether they have dial-up or

10   not, and then sorts everybody else into some

11   category of broadband connection. But we're

12   not getting a very close read on who has cable

13   modem versus DSL versus fiber, that sort of

14   thing. So it's a long way of saying it was an

15   opt-in technique, but it was a technique we

16   went to great pains to try to really pin

17   people down on dial-up versus broadband.

18   Next slide, Slide 14, just

19   discusses the techniques we use for

20   understanding the reasons for non-adoption.

21   And one reason we did this was really to try

22   to improve on techniques used at the Pew

1   Internet Project in the past to try to

2   understand non-adoption. At Pew we tended to

3   ask people if you don't have broadband, well

4   why not, and then code the answers

5   accordingly. Here, we undertook a two-step

6   approach of giving people a list of different

7   reasons that they may or may not - different

8   reasons of why they don't have broadband, let

9   them list those reasons for us and then do a

10   follow-up question asking, okay, what is the

11   most important reason, or what is the main

12   reason why you don't have broadband at home.

13   So it kind of anchored a list of reasons in

14   people's heads as step one, and step two, pin

15   them down with a question on so what's the

16   most important reason that you don't have

17   broadband at home. And Slide 15 I won't go

18   into any great detail, but Slide 15 lists the

19   menu of reasons that we asked people about as

20   to why they may not have broadband at home.

21   So you can look at them there. There are a

22   whole range of reasons, the ones in green

1   pertaining to cost, the ones in red pertaining

2   to digital literacy, and then the ones in blue

3   pertaining to those who we're going to

4   categorize as not having awareness of relevant

5   content online.

6   So the results on the next page

7   are really in some way some of the core

8   findings of the survey, and these are the main

9   reasons people do not adopt broadband at home.

10   So 36 percent cite reasons pertaining to cost.

11   In the white paper itself we have analysis on

12   how these factors vary across different

13   demographic groups. So overall 36 percent of

14   non-adopters cited cost as a barrier to

15   adoption. For Hispanics actually 52 percent

16   of Hispanics cited cost as the reason they do

17   not have broadband at home. Forty-two percent

18   of African-Americans cited cost as the main

19   reason they do not have broadband at home. So

20   those two minority groups had a higher

21   incidence of citing cost as a reason for not

22   being online. Twenty-two percent cited - of

1   non-adopters cited reasons pertaining to

2   digital literacy as the reason that they're

3   not online, then 19 percent cited issues

4   pertaining to not being aware of relevant

5   content. What's also important to recognize

6   is that although the data in this slide focus

7   on - in Slide 16, the data in Slide 16 focus

8   on the main reasons that people don't have

9   broadband to home, in fact since people in the

10   prior question in the survey could cite more

11   than one reason for not having broadband at

12   home, another important takeaway from the

13   survey is that there are in fact multiple

14   reasons for non-adoption. So people who cited

15   cost were quite likely to cite digital

16   literacy and relevance as factors that they

17   have in not having broadband at home. So the

18   survey enables us to see the main reasons for

19   people not having broadband at home, but also

20   understand that there are typically multiple

21   reasons for people not having broadband at

22   home.

1   What I may do in the interests of

2   time is just skip ahead to Slide 20, and Slide

3   20 is really the output of a bunch of analysis

4   that I describe in the several slides leading

5   up to it. And what we wanted to do again in

6   understanding the different reasons underlying

7   non-adoption is really understand the many

8   dimensions of non-adoption. So what this

9   slide shows is a result of a little segmenting

10   exercise which asks the question is the reason

11   for non-adoption having to do with attitude or

12   overall level of technology assets or some

13   combination thereto. So what do I mean by

14   that? One, people who don't have broadband at

15   home aren't necessarily divorced from modern

16   information and communication technology.

17   Many of them have cell phones, many of them

18   have computers. Secondly, people who don't

19   have broadband at home aren't monolithic in

20   their attitudes towards broadband. Some

21   people think information technology is a good

22   thing, some think it's a dangerous and scary

1   sort of thing. Other - some people think

2   information technology is a good thing for

3   learning, others rate lower on those indices.

4   So this typology sorts the 35 percent of non-

5   adopters into four categories based on a

6   likelihood that they may adopt broadband. So

7   the green box of near converts are 10 percent

8   of the population who in fact have a high rate

9   of computer ownership and a high rate of

10   comfort with information technology and

11   positive attitudes towards it. A lot of them

12   are the people that Andy asked about earlier

13   who are internet users, but just not at home.

14   These people stand a pretty good chance

15   probably of getting broadband since they have

16   good attitudes toward it and some experience

17   with the internet to begin with. They cite

18   mainly cost as their barrier to getting online

19   so if you could help them with cost you could

20   get a pretty quick conversion rate of them to

21   broadband. The red box is the opposite end of

22   the spectrum, that's the digitally distant.

1   That's 10 percent of the general population

2   who lack the skills and resources to get

3   online and also have negative attitudes

4   towards cyberspace. So this is your toughest

5   sell for getting the 35 percent of non-

6   adopters online with broadband since they lack

7   the skills, they face significant cost hurdles

8   and have sour attitudes about information

9   technology. The two categories coded in

10   yellow are sort of in between and I won't go

11   into them in any great detail, but that's 15

12   percent of the population who show in

13   different ways some glimmers of hope to

14   getting online, but also face some significant

15   barriers having to do with either digital

16   literacy or understanding the relevance of

17   broadband.

18   So with that I'll conclude, field

19   any additional questions or open it up to

20   discussion if we have any. Karen first, then

21   Charles.

22   MS. NARASAKI: Thanks John, this

 1   is very interesting. Did you find any racial

 2   differences for the Slide 20, the four

 3   categories? Were there differences among the

 4   groups in terms of which boxes they were more

 5   likely to fall into?

 6   MR. HORRIGAN: Yes, and I'm trying

 7   to recall that. For I believe it was the

 8   digitally uncomfortable group that was heavily

 9   - I'm sorry, the digitally hopeful group was

10   heavily Hispanic. I think that group had 26

11   percent of Hispanics. So that was the one

12   group which had a notable racial difference

13   across the four groups. Charles?

14   MR. WARFIELD: Mine was just

15   generally. Was there any, and I don't know

16   whether you had this data, but geographic

17   relevance to any of this data in terms of

18   their attitudes towards the internet for the

19   non-adopters?

20   MR. HORRIGAN: It was - given the

21   sample size even though, as I've said it was

22   rather large for national surveys, it's

1   difficult to get down to geographic levels for

2   any of the categories of non-adopters

3   unfortunately. One day I need a big Census

4   survey.

5   MR. BLACKWELL: Thank you for

6   this. There are parts of it that are very

7   encouraging, and there are parts of it that

8   are troubling for me for the nation as a

9   whole. But I wanted to ask you a follow-up on

10   a question that Karen had asked earlier, but

11   I - from a higher level, how do you regard

12   this study as being relevant for Native

13   America?

14   MR. HORRIGAN: As the Chairman

15   said, we are aware of and sorely understand

16   the need for more research on Native American

17   populations. I think - again, this grows out

18   from some of the workshops we had which

19   included representatives from the tribal

20   lands. Relevance could be a prominent barrier

21   for the population subgroup because we just

22   heard in our workshops how once infrastructure

 1   is made available in many of these locations

 2   there develops quickly an active set of users

 3   and a community of users, so I think for the

 4   tribal areas in particular once you solve the

 5   infrastructure problem, moving toward training

 6   to help people understand the relevance of

 7   broadband and building digital skills are the

 8   challenges you want to address right after

 9   that. And again from our workshops there's

10   some indication that there's some latent

11   demand there and that people quickly become

12   converted to this stuff.

13   MR. BLACKWELL: Our best estimate

14   says - to pin a broadband penetration rate on

15   tribal lands is 10 percent. That's reflected

16   in the Broadband Plan and we all heard what

17   the Chairman said, and he himself has stated

18   this to tribal leaders. That comes from a

19   couple of - more than a couple of years of

20   discussion among tribal businesses and tribal

21   leaders nationwide, and every one of the

22   commenters from Indian country to the National

1   Broadband Plan underscored that.

2   I want to draw your attention to a

3   study, the first ever study on broadband in

4   Indian country. It's a study that was

5   performed by Native Public Media and the New

6   America Foundation. And if you've not seen

7   this I want to get a copy of it to you because

8   it underscores what you just said, that on

9   tribal lands it is largely a function of lack

10   of infrastructure, but that certain of the

11   results in your study are - there was a

12   different take in Indian country. There is a

13   faster adoption rate. There are particular

14   literacy challenges. And on your work going

15   forward I would encourage you to use a very

16   special tool that you have in the government,

17   the government relationship that the

18   Commission shares and recognizes in this plan

19   for - to ping the tribal governments

20   themselves as those who can help you double-

21   check your results, some of those who know

22   their communities better than anyone. There

 1   is a great opportunity in Indian country for

 2   the deployment of broadband. I think what you

 3   will also learn is just how in the next study

 4   and what the implications of your study lead

 5   us to conclusions about where - what sort of

 6   industrial plans will succeed, what sort of

 7   business models will succeed. One thing that

 8   this study, the New America and Native Public

 9   Media study represents is that it's often

10   those that - in Indian country, it's those

11   business models that are going to meet that

12   particular economic challenge, those extreme

13   economic challenges and the extreme literacy

14   needs. So even though it didn't include

15   Indian country to a great depth, I'm hopeful

16   that with the plans that you have that we can

17   see that in the future.

18   MR. HORRIGAN: We are definitely

19   going to try to have the recommendations

20   implemented and bring life to them so we can

21   get better data and continue the dialogue that

22   we've already established with the tribal

 1 leaders.

 2   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Well thank you

 3 very much, John. We appreciate your taking

 4 time to come and speak with us today. It's

 5 very interesting. Now we're going to hear

 6 from our friends from Joint Center. Ralph,

 7 thank you very much for making these folks

 8 available to us. Dr. Gant and Dr. Lee you

 9 have the floor with the caveat that I promised

10 to let these people go by 4 o'clock. So you

11 need to move along on this. Thank you.

12   DR. GANT: Okay, thank you

13 Chairman Rivera and thank you for inviting us.

14 And it's a real pleasure to be able to share

15 our results, especially after John Horrigan's

16 results were reported as well too. And I'm

17 here with Dr. Ying Li and Dr. Nicol Turner-Lee

18 was also here but she had another speaking

19 engagement. But thanks for having our team

20 here today, and we also thank Ralph Everett

21 for all his support on this too, for the extra

22 coffee bills and so forth that we gave him to

 1   try and stay up to get this done on time.

 2   MR. EVERETT: You're welcome.

 3   (Laughter)

 4   DR. GANT: But our report really

 5   tries to zero in and focus on the experience

 6   of minorities in terms of adopting - using

 7   internet - broadband internet. And you know,

 8   as was really clear with all the very exciting

 9   studies that's out there, there is a very

10   large opportunity to take advantage of the

11   internet, but of course then the great

12   challenge of trying to figure out how to make

13   the whole experience more inclusive.

14   So a goal of our work which is

15   Slide I guess 3 here is really to try and look

16   at the issue of acceptance and use of

17   broadband internet among minorities. It's one

18   slide back. Thank you. And also to let this

19   become the basis of a longitudinal study of

20   analysis that we'd also like to do at the

21   Joint Center. And this study is really the

22   first study to really zero in, focus on

1   minorities. And we do have the same issue

2   that John Horrigan mentioned, that when you

3   start looking at minorities the sample size is

4   a problem with having a sample size that's

5   representative and large enough. In this

6   study it was the first to do an over-sample

7   based on minorities. Our numbers are a little

8   bit larger than John's in terms of minorities

9   but still there's an issue of having

10   statistically significant data as well too.

11   And so with this - next slide,

12   please. And with our work we partnered with

13   the Princeton Survey Research Group. This is

14   the group that works with Pew to do their

15   study, and many of our questions actually are

16   modeled after Pew so there's similarities

17   between our study, the FCC study, Pew study as

18   well too. The studies were done in bilingual

19   as well, as we've just heard. And the other

20   thing that we've done is we supplement this

21   with field research that our team is doing in

22   Chicago, San Francisco and East St. Louis,

 1   Illinois. And one very particular thing that

 2   distinguishes our study is our model about

 3   acceptance and use. We're trying to figure

 4   out was there a rich way of sorting out all

 5   these different factors. And so if you go to

 6   the next slide, please. And so we've taken

 7   this model which we call broadband acceptance

 8   and use to try and organize all these

 9   different factors because we believe that

10   being online and staying online is about cost,

11   it's about relevance, but it's about other

12   things too. It's about how easy is the

13   technology to use. If I get online, if I

14   finally get online, am I going to be able to

15   do the things that I really want to be able to

16   do? Are there resources that are available,

17   not only in the community by being able to go

18   into a library, learning through school, or at

19   the job, but frankly what we learned through

20   a number of our field research studies was

21   that people learn from each other. And it was

22   very interesting to hear studies of people

 1   learning for - this inter-generational

 2   learning. We did a study, a field research in

 3   Chicago where there's a woman there who's the

 4   executive director for a very large non-profit

 5   doing a lot of great things there and so we

 6   asked her how did you learn. She said frankly

 7   it was because my 12-year-old son was

 8   learning. I had questions, and I knew I could

 9   close the door and ask him and I wouldn't be

10   embarrassed. If I asked my staff I wouldn't

11   be able to get the same kind of response. So

12   she said she learned a lot from her son. So

13   there's - so this is an important factor. And

14   of course, you know, you control for things

15   like age, your prior experience, and things

16   like that. And so we're using this as a model

17   to try to estimate the likelihood of people

18   going online so we can try and estimate the

19   size of this digital exclusion and the cost of

20   exclusion, and also to think about policy

21   options where oftentimes because of budgets

22   and so forth a lot of policy options are sort

 1   of piecemeal. And we were trying to figure

 2   out which factor is going to be the most

 3   important as we do think about and begin the

 4   policy discussion as well. So this framework

 5   really helps us to do that. So this is what

 6   we're going to be working on in the short term

 7   and in the long run as well too.

 8   All right, some of the key

 9   highlights, and a lot of things kind of really

10   piggy-back off the FCC study so next slide,

11   please. And it was actually very important

12   that there was some corroboration with our

13   data with the three major studies that are out

14   there - or the four, the Pew, the NTIA and the

15   FCC study. So our data, it fits right in line

16   with everybody else's, but again we drilled

17   down further into trying to break out things

18   by race. So of course as John mentioned one

19   of the key things is income, and with our data

20   we confirmed this as well too and we actually

21   break this out by income. And you can see

22   that income is a major - there's a large gap

 1   between - based on income. But then within

 2   each income bracket there's actually

 3   similarities based on race. And so this

 4   really helps to reinforce that income is a

 5   very important factor in explaining the

 6   differences.

 7   Similar with - the next slide

 8   please - with education. Education also

 9   there's a very large gap with folks with a

10   college degree or better, an average of about

11   80 percent are online. Rather, folks with

12   just a high school or less, you know, it's

13   more than half of the country is not online.

14   So we can see that education is a factor and

15   then again with our data we can see there's a

16   similar pattern across the races. Not

17   necessarily significant differences, but we do

18   see similar patterns. And then the next

19   slide, please.

20   And then we get into age, and here

21   age becomes a really interesting story.

22   Again, confirms what other studies are saying,

 1   but here we're starting to see that even

 2   though there is an age gap there's also an age

 3   and race gap as well too. And in fact, it's

 4   very significant when we were looking at older

 5   Americans that are 50 years or older, that

 6   race really does play a big difference, a

 7   significant difference in terms of broadband

 8   adoption. So that's, you know, raises concern

 9   in seeing that a number of seniors are left

10   behind. And I think the Broadband Plan does

11   talk about initiatives to try and bridge that

12   gap, but that's a very significant gap that

13   really needs to be underscored as well.

14   And as the Chairman Genachowski

15   and Commissioner Clyburn reported, you know,

16   there is a great promise for broadband. The

17   uptake rate is significant, it's good, but the

18   other thing that's real subtle here is that -

19   next slide, please - we've also noted that

20   there is a big demographic difference in who

21   are the newcomers and who are the folks that

22   are really well established on the internet.

 1   When we break down the data in this way we see

 2   that minorities are over-represented as

 3   newcomers to the internet, and so this really

 4   raises questions about what does that mean.

 5   Well, from a personal anecdote, you know,

 6   thinking of my family, they get online now and

 7   I've been online for, you know, 20 years, but

 8   they always email me about things that were

 9   relevant five, ten years ago, you know, the

10   latest viruses and things like that. So it

11   really raises the question of if minorities

12   are over-represented as newcomers, what also

13   needs to be done to really help newcomers

14   understand the whole culture of the internet.

15   Not only literacy, but there's also a culture

16   component of being online to understand. But

17   then, is the internet ready for the newcomers

18   because it's kind of a dynamic space where it

19   should evolve and grow and should be - and as

20   I heard in a talk earlier this week, it should

21   be an echo system that also takes in and

22   evolves as new people come on as well too. So

 1   it's going to be exciting to see how this

 2   happens.

 3   In terms of where folks are

 4   getting online, we see that there's a

 5   difference in who uses public access points

 6   like libraries, for example, and we find that

 7   African-Americans and Hispanics tend to use

 8   public access points like libraries

 9   significantly. And this also raises a

10   question because as we report later, a number

11   of minorities, a high percentage of minorities

12   go online for job apps, educational, things

13   like that, which tend to be media-rich type of

14   applications. But then if you're depending on

15   libraries and schools for those places, those

16   are places where you also have caps on the

17   amount of data that you can download in a

18   session. You know, you may only get a half

19   hour of time, but you're limited in the amount

20   of video you can watch and things like that.

21   I personally - I teach - one thing broadband

22   has done for me is that I'm here in

1   Washington, D.C. but I'm still a professor at

2   the University of Illinois, and I'm teaching

3   my classes online on Tuesday nights and

4   Thursday nights from my condominium. And so

5   I'm able to do that because of broadband. But

6   then if I have students that have to go to a

7   library, they can't watch my entire lecture.

8   I don't guarantee they do when I'm there

9   anyway, but nonetheless though.

10   (Laughter)

11   DR. GANT: You know, so there's

12   limits on what you can do in public places in

13   terms of internet. So that's an important

14   issue as well too. And next slide, please.

15   Our report is rich with lots of data and so

16   forth, so again I'm just really touching on

17   highlights. But we also ask what are folks -

18   what are they doing online, and broke that

19   down by race as well too. And next slide,

20   please. And one thing that stands out is a

21   significant racial difference in terms of

22   looking for a job, where 78 percent of

1   African-Americans report that they use the

2   internet for looking for a job, and there's a

3   significant difference there. Next slide,

4   please. And again, what's nice about our data

5   is that we can break this down further. So

6   then we said, okay, how does that look based

7   on income. And when we look at income we see

8   that the lowest income bracket, 92 percent of

9   African-Americans that make less than $20,000

10   are online looking for a job. And again, our

11   data teases that out, and so I think it can

12   add some sharpness to our discussion about how

13   broadband is being used. Next slide, please.

14   And again, similar type of

15   analysis for education where again, when you

16   look at sort of the end of the spectrum where

17   folks are high school graduate or less, again

18   we see this big difference. We know education

19   is a difference and we also know that there's

20   differences in what people do online, and then

21   when we break it down by race we see that

22   there's a strong racial difference as well

1   too. Next slide, please.

2   The next slide talks about where

3   people get online, work, library and so forth.

4   We did some fun analysis. You know, Ying is

5   always careful to say when we cut our data,

6   you know, we can't cut it too thin because of

7   the significance, statistical significance,

8   but this is one question where we looked at

9   work, right? We all get online at work, but

10   again when you break it down by income you see

11   there's a big racial difference. Because

12   folks that are on the lower income level don't

13   have the same time in their job to get online

14   there. So then subsequently we see kind of a

15   higher use by lower income at the public

16   library and also with schools as well too.

17   Next slide, please.

18   And then device ownership. Cell

19   phone is king so far and - next slide, please

20   - and we see that's pretty consistent by race

21   that roughly 80 percent of the population is

22   using the cell phone, but - next slide, please

1 - but when we look at cell phone activities,

2 again, at the first level we don't see this

3 richness but when we start breaking it down a

4 little bit further then all of a sudden we see

5 wow, there are some big differences in how

6 folks are using the cell phone, and I think

7 it's very exciting. We see that sending text

8 messages and emails are obviously very

9 popular, but we're seeing things that our data

10 also talks - there's a racial difference in

11 terms of who's looking for jobs, government

12 information, and things like that. And so it

13 really becomes a question of just how that

14 robust is that interface and then why are some

15 pockets of our population adopting it more

16 than others, and what can we learn from that

17 if we want to try and see more widespread

18 adoption as the Chairman also noted as well

19 too. Yes?

20   MS. SUTTER: John, can I ask one

21 question on that? The cell phone activity,

22 I've got to believe that there's an age factor

 1   -

 2   DR. GANT: Yes, there is.

 3   MS. SUTTER: - that is significant

 4   in this, because it's hard for me to believe

 5   that more people are downloading a ringtone

 6   than sending an email. So I'm gathering that

 7   there's a real differentiation by age on this

 8   particular slide that would make a big

 9   difference.

10   DR. GANT: Yes, absolutely there

11   is. The ringtone folks are the young folks

12   that are out there, our millennials that are

13   out there. Although, you know, I was in

14   church with my mom the other day and there are

15   a lot of -

16   MS. SUTTER: She was downloading a

17   ringtone?

18   DR. GANT: Yes, she's got - yes,

19   you know.

20   MS. SUTTER: Way cool mom.

21   DR. GANT: And she's in that 65 -

22   oh, I can't say her age. She's in the older

1   age group, you know.

2   (Laughter)

3   MS. NARASAKI: Younger people also

4   aren't using email, they're texting.

5   DR. GANT: Yes, they're texting a

6   lot, they're texting a lot.

7   MS. SUTTER: Right, but as I say,

8   this slide seemed to me it would be a

9   different viewpoint if we had it by age too.

10   DR. GANT: Right, I agree, I

11   agree. Just in interest of time, this

12   question of non-adoption is very important.

13   The FCC study over-sampled for that as well

14   too. And this is the sticky part of the

15   question. How do we deal with the non-

16   adoption? What I appreciate about the FCC

17   study is that segmentation. We're going to

18   put that frame here with our data as we

19   analyze it more, but it's certainly trying to

20   understand of course cost is an issue, but

21   there's this large group that says look, I'm

22   just not interested. And so we've got to try

 1   and understand what does that mean in terms of

 2   thinking about the future of internet,

 3   broadband, and so forth. And then - next

 4   slide, please - and then we also asked if you

 5   could get online, what would you do? Most

 6   folks want to use it for social, stay in touch

 7   with family and friends, and that type of

 8   thing, and also government information.

 9   So I know we had to rush through

10   this. The study is available online, but

11   again, what it does, it really compliments the

12   earlier work with our over-sample that we can

13   really focus in on minority issues. I wish it

14   were more robust per Ms. Narasaki's comments

15   about all groups. We tried to look at it, but

16   Dr. Li you know was very careful to say we're

17   cutting it too thin and we can't say anything

18   statistically significant. We could see

19   trends with this, but - and we would like to

20   be able to get richer data, so probably what

21   we're going to do is a longitudinal study to

22   look at that. We also have another study

 1   looking at mobile use, that's zeroing in on

 2   the mobile question to try and understand that

 3   more clearly, and then also we have Joe Miller

 4   who's here in our audience who's also looking

 5   at some policy issues around this as well too.

 6   So we've got a lot of work in front of us, but

 7   that's really what we're zeroing in and

 8   focusing on.

 9   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Thank you very

10   much and in particular thank you for minding

11   the time. It's very interesting and you did

12   a wonderful job. Toni, I'm hoping that you

13   will find these two studies rich field for

14   your subcommittee. Maybe you can come back to

15   us with some recommendations, particularly

16   working with Joe who's developing some policy

17   recommendations around this. So all right.

18   Is there anything else to come before the

19   group? All right, Susan. I mean Karen, I'm

20   sorry.

21   MS. NARASAKI: Yes, I just want to

22   note, I met with the executive director of the

1   White House Initiative on Asian-American and

2   Pacific Islanders. The President had signed

3   the executive order late last year and so it's

4   up and running at the Department of Education

5   and they have an interagency task force. And

6   I was very pleased to hear from her that the

7   FCC, even though it wasn't called out in the

8   executive order, actually volunteered to be

9   part of the interagency task force. So I just

10   want to commend the FCC and find out who at

11   the FCC is actually going to be doing that.

12   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Do you know the

13   answer to that question, Tom? Okay. Is that

14   responsive, Karen? Okay. Toni?

15   MS. BUSH: One thing I was just

16   going to raise is in connection with both

17   Native Americans, but also particularly with

18   Asian-Americans. I think that there is - it's

19   an important area for the FCC and for this

20   committee to look at because there is very

21   little information on if, for example, the

22   Arbitron which keeps track of radio listening

 1   has very little information on Asian stations

 2   even though there are significant Asian

 3   stations and there are challenges. I mean,

 4   you know, I have a client who has an Asian-

 5   focused television station and he, you know,

 6   has programming in 10 different languages and

 7   so I'm sure it's complicated, you know, how

 8   you do it, but I do think it's an area that

 9   the FCC and the federal government you know

10   should be spending time given the size of the

11   Asian-American population. And I know there's

12   been a lot of discussion on Native American

13   population, but I think the difficulties in

14   gathering that information shouldn't preclude

15   us from trying to get it and really working in

16   that arena because I think not just in

17   connection with broadband, but generally in

18   connection with use of technology and media

19   it's an area where we don't have a lot of

20   information and the government and I think the

21   American people would benefit from having more

22   information.

1   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: Let me - can I

2   ask you to think about that a little more and

3   make some suggestions about where we might

4   pigeonhole that in our committee? Because I

5   agree with you 100 percent. We need somebody

6   to dig in and work on it.

7   MS. BUSH: Yes, we'll work on that.

8   MS. NARASAKI: I'd be happy to do

9   that. I think the challenge is because the

10   little data that's out there that looks at the

11   Asian community broadly shows us it's in

12   pretty good shape, but the few little research

13   that's been out that dug a little deeper

14   showed the disparity that's within the Asian-

15   American community by ethnic group. So the

16   challenge is you have to do the research down

17   to the ethnic group level to really understand

18   what's happening, and we do know that there

19   are people who are falling behind so I would

20   love to work with Toni on that.

21   MS. BUSH: And then I just have

22   one other thing which is that, you know, I did

1 want to just say, to congratulate Andy

2 Schwartzman on bringing Ty Brown in, but also

3 to thank him for all of his work. I'm

4 stealing from Ralph a trick that he uses, but

5 you know, Andy's a friend, a colleague, a

6 supporter, an opponent. He's thoughtful,

7 smart, hard-working, he likes crossword

8 puzzles, he's a music lover, he's committed,

9 he's been a mentor to a lot of us and I just

10 want to say, you know, thank you.

11   (Applause)

12   CHAIRMAN RIVERA: He'll be around.

13 He'll be doing his Sudoku and all of his

14 crossword puzzles still with us. But very

15 well said, thank you for that. Anything else

16 to come before the committee? Well, thank you

17 all for coming. We're going to go ahead and

18 stand adjourned, and we'll be in touch about

19 a June meeting. Hope to see you all then.

20 Thank you.

21   (Whereupon, the foregoing matter

22 went off the record at 4:04 p.m.)

Census-based 63:7
65:9
center 2:13,16,21
3:21 5:15 64:17
92:6 93:21
centers 21:21 54:20
central 54:2
certain 90:10
certainly 7:6 60:4
107:19
certainty 62:17
chair 43:19 44:14
45:9
chairman 1:10,13
1:22 3:5,8,9 4:16
5:20,21 7:4,8 9:9
10:7,9,10,17
11:20,22 12:3
17:22 26:8 37:13
38:5,21 39:17
40:11 41:3,7,19
41:21 42:6,10
43:18 44:4,7,9,18
44:21 45:1,7
46:18 49:20,21
50:6,9,11,22 51:2
51:21,21 52:12
53:11 54:7 56:7
59:13 60:1,6,14
88:14 89:17 92:2
92:13 99:14
105:18 109:9
110:12 112:1
113:12
chairs 8:17 50:13
50:14
challenge 14:4,4
91:12 93:12 112:9
112:16
challenges 16:4
20:9 21:8 36:9
89:8 90:14 91:13
111:3
challenging 29:12
chance 85:14
chances 15:12
change 38:20

changed 57:15
72:14
changes 8:6 9:21
16:5,6 41:15
changing 11:18
channel 30:19
channels 35:15
Charisse 13:12
Charles 1:18 86:21
87:13
charter 4:22 51:2,3
chartered 52:6
chat 13:7
check 77:12 78:22
79:5 90:21
checking 79:1
checklists 42:16
Chicago 28:13
94:22 96:3
chief 16:21
children 23:21,22
choose 76:17
Chorus 44:6,20
50:8
church 106:14
circle 17:20
circulate 64:14
circulated 40:9
cite 64:10 73:16,17
82:10 83:10,15
85:17
cited 80:1 82:14,16
82:18,22 83:1,3
83:14
citing 82:21
citizens 31:20 33:1
70:16
clarify 56:21
class 33:22
classes 102:3
classified 80:3
classifieds 23:12
clear 93:8
clearly 73:5 109:3
client 111:4
close 8:5 57:8 80:12
96:9

closely 15:17 39:18
cloud 30:1
Clyburn 1:22
10:12,22 17:8,10
17:11,18 26:1
37:4,10,12 38:4
40:2,5 51:22
55:19 99:15
Clyburn's 18:14
code 81:4
coded 86:9
coffee 92:22
collaboration
40:22
colleague 113:5
colleagues 26:2
collecting 72:9
college 70:4,9
98:10
combination 84:13
come 11:12 13:6
16:9 18:9 24:21
35:10,12 51:12
68:19 92:4 100:22
109:14,18 113:16
comes 7:11 17:3
22:3 43:11 45:22
67:6 89:18
comfort 85:10
coming 6:20 34:18
65:15 113:17
commend 58:1
110:10
commenters 89:22
comments 51:20
108:14
commerce 20:18
Commission 1:1
9:19 11:1,17 12:6
12:10 13:10 26:2
27:1 37:8 42:14
43:7 44:12 48:5
55:18,20 90:18
Commissioner
1:22 10:12,21
17:8,10,11,18
18:14 26:1 37:4,9

37:12 38:4 40:5
51:22 55:18 99:15
commissioners
1:21 18:6 45:7
52:2 56:8
Commission's 5:14
10:2
commitment 27:17
40:18,19
committed 38:17
38:19 56:4,8 58:3
60:2 113:8
committee 1:3,12
3:5 4:18 5:8 8:8
9:7 11:14 12:12
13:11 14:12 25:22
33:3 37:7 38:10
40:18 44:15 48:4
49:12,13,19 50:20
51:3 52:11 57:5
57:11 59:11 60:7
110:20 112:4
113:16
committee's 14:22
communicate 18:5
communication
84:16
communications
1:1,4 2:6 3:11
16:6 39:12
communities 19:19
22:4,7,8,8 23:22
27:13,18 63:10,21
90:22
community 7:1
27:5 63:22 65:7
89:3 95:17 112:11
112:15
companies 15:4
23:13,14,16 30:21
34:14 47:16,19
Comparative 3:18
compare 71:7
compared 70:12
competitors 21:21
complicated 111:7
compliments

108:11
complying 42:17
component 52:21
100:16
computer 85:9
computers 33:18
84:18
computing 30:1
concern 99:8
concerns 35:3 41:6
conclude 86:18
concluded 33:19
conclusions 91:5
condominium
102:4
conducted 61:2
62:4,9 63:8 65:19
67:7
conference 47:21
confess 17:7
confirm 79:19
confirmed 13:21
97:20
confirms 22:5,6
98:22
congratulate 113:1
congratulations
7:5 50:12
Congress 11:11
48:6
connected 75:7
connection 53:13
68:16 79:4,17,20
79:21 80:11
110:16 111:17,18
connections 75:6
78:18 79:14
connectors 27:16
consider 8:8 9:20
22:20 43:16 66:7
considerably 71:21
consistent 104:20
constituent 54:1
constitutional
12:20 55:11
consumer 2:4 3:15
31:5

consumers 28:11
30:13 72:16
content 73:19 82:5
83:5
context 39:9
continue 8:8 25:12
38:9 46:14 48:7
91:21
continued 40:21
continues 8:10
58:13
contracts 18:13
contribution 12:5
control 4:7 96:14
convened 1:9
converge 43:15
converged 76:6
converges 78:4
conversation 17:9
23:10 53:5
conversations 46:7
47:8 58:17
conversion 85:20
converted 89:12
converts 85:7
Cook 12:22
cool 106:20
coordinate 15:3
46:21
coordinated 14:11
copy 90:7
core 82:7
corps 27:11,17
correct 77:20
correctly 14:17
correlation 73:1
corroboration
97:12
cost 23:4 30:2
73:16 77:10 82:1
82:10,14,16,18,21
83:15 85:18,19
86:7 95:10 96:19
107:20
costs 22:20 35:11
35:21
counter-intuitive

73:14
countries 21:19
country 20:10,12
20:21 21:12 22:17
30:10 34:12 36:17
41:16 66:11 89:22
90:4,12 91:1,10
91:15 98:13
country's 31:13
couple 39:21 54:11
89:19,19
course 15:16,22
20:14 32:11 33:19
36:1,20 47:22
93:11 96:14 97:18
107:20
covered 59:2
cracking 51:5
create 29:18 35:19
creating 23:9
creation 27:10 34:5
34:6,11
creatively 15:6
34:20
critical 39:10
crossword 113:7,14
cultural 74:17
culture 100:14,15
curious 76:20
current 58:14
79:19
currently 47:17
65:20
customers 29:19,20
cut 18:2 104:5,6
cutting 108:17
cyberspace 86:4

D

D 1:15
daily 77:22
dangerous 84:22
Danny 13:14
data 61:16,18
63:18,20,21 68:6
71:8 72:6,9,12,12
72:18,22 75:2

76:1 83:6,7 87:16
87:17 91:21 94:10
97:13,15,19 98:15
100:1 101:17
102:15 103:4,11
104:5 105:9
107:18 108:20
112:10
date 39:20
David 1:15 12:21
55:12,16,21 56:10
59:19
day 4:20 11:2 13:2
24:7 88:3 106:14
days 39:3
deal 45:19 48:11,21
73:8,9 107:15
dealing 55:5,8
deals 46:2 49:1
dealt 57:17
decade 34:5
decades 55:20
December 4:22 5:1
45:16
decent 71:9,15
dedicated 18:18
60:6 64:22
deeper 112:13
define 37:22 78:10
definitely 57:6
91:18
degree 70:2 98:10
demand 89:11
democracy 20:20
24:13 25:16
democratic 23:3
demographic 82:13
99:20
Department 110:4
depending 101:14
deployed 31:12
33:2 47:15
deployment 20:10
20:11 76:2,8 78:4
91:2
depth 91:15
Deputy 2:2,3

describe 84:4
describes 62:8
design 77:13
Designated 2:2 3:3
designing 63:15
desirable 35:5
detail 8:14 27:21
54:9 61:7,10
69:14 72:4 81:18
86:11
determine 56:22
77:4
developed 34:19
developing 15:21
16:4 109:16
development 18:20
48:8 54:20 55:2
develops 89:2
device 104:18
dial 62:5,9
dialogue 41:5
91:21
dial-up 69:5 75:18
77:2 79:15,17,20
80:2,8,9,17
Diane 1:18 3:8 5:11
7:18,20 8:20
12:21 45:2 50:12
52:16,20 53:3
59:1
difference 16:17
27:20 64:19 87:12
99:6,7,20 101:5
102:21 103:3,18
103:19,22 104:11
105:10 106:9
differences 71:2
87:2,3 98:6,17
103:20 105:5
different 14:11
16:3 36:15 68:2
70:21 72:7,8,9
76:3 77:9 78:17
81:6,7 82:12 84:6
86:13 90:12 95:5
95:9 107:9 111:6
differentiation

106:7
difficult 29:11
62:16 88:1
difficulties 111:13
dig 72:22 112:6
digit 62:9
digital 1:4 4:19
22:20 24:11 25:7
25:11,15 27:10,16
27:17 54:15 57:19
73:18 82:2 83:2
83:15 86:15 89:7
96:19
digitally 85:22 87:8
87:9
digress 42:9
Diller 28:20
dimensions 84:8
direction 38:22
directive 18:7
directly 18:5
director 2:4,5,15
3:13,15,21 6:15
17:2 53:15 96:4
109:22
Director's 18:12
disadvantage 23:19
24:18 25:5
disadvantaged
48:10,15
disadvantaging
25:8
discrepancies 70:5
discrepancy 67:5
discuss 5:13 9:1,12
43:21
discussed 40:15
discusses 80:19
discussing 52:22
57:18
discussion 20:8
44:2,16 45:21
50:3 57:13,15
58:2,3,12 61:13
86:20 89:20 97:4
103:12 111:12
Disney 2:19

disparity 112:14
disposal 55:6
distant 85:22
distinguished 12:7
distinguishes 95:2
diverse 54:5
diversify 48:10,18
diversifying 48:21
  49:4
diversity 1:3 3:5
  4:18 14:12 16:15
  16:22 18:15 19:1
  25:22 35:3 36:9
  40:19,20 48:4
divided 8:2
dividing 69:17,19
  70:16
divorced 84:15
doable 40:16
docketed 57:3
doing 7:12 11:11
  12:4 14:7 17:17
  23:13,14 29:21
  35:19 46:13 52:17
  54:8 58:4,22 59:2
  78:7 94:21 96:5
  102:18 110:11
  113:13
door 59:6 96:9
double 90:20
download 101:17
downloading 106:5
  106:16
Dr 3:21 22:5 92:8,8
  92:12,17,17 93:4
  102:11 106:2,10
  106:18,21 107:5
  107:10 108:16
draw 90:2
drill 68:6 76:22
drilled 97:16
DSL 77:3 78:20
  79:6 80:13
dug 112:13
dynamic 100:18
D.C 1:10 29:2,8
  102:1

E

e 31:14 33:4
earlier 9:10 75:13
  85:12 88:10
  100:20 108:12
early 4:22 64:17
East 94:22
easy 95:12
echo 60:4 100:21
economic 2:14,16
  2:21 3:22 5:16
  29:12 35:18 54:13
  58:14 74:12 91:12
  91:13
economically 70:13
economy 24:13
  25:15 27:14
educate 25:12
education 18:20
  31:13 69:19,21,22
  74:12,17 98:8,8
  98:14 103:15,18
  110:4
educational 46:3
  48:21 52:21 53:20
  101:12
EEO 8:3,16,21 9:3
  9:12 42:17 43:1,5
  43:8 44:11,13
effect 73:8
effectively 77:12
effects 74:14
effort 40:21 45:9
efforts 40:20
eight 6:12 40:8
either 57:2 78:3
  86:15
electricity 20:16
electronic 31:18
  32:18
eliminated 47:18
elimination 47:8
eloquently 42:11
else's 97:16
email 75:8 100:8
  106:6 107:4
emailed 5:7

emails 105:8
embarrassed 96:10
embarrassing
  22:11
embrace 39:8
emphasis 54:15
employed 79:9
employees 29:10
  29:10
employment 9:22
enables 83:18
encourage 29:3
  36:4 41:1,2 59:7
  90:15
encouraged 18:3
  79:8
encouragement
  42:2
encouraging 52:7
  88:7
endorsing 53:10
energized 14:1
energy 12:9 14:8
  31:21
engaged 59:14
engagement 41:5
  92:19
engine 34:10
entertain 61:13
entire 66:6 102:7
entirely 64:22
entities 58:10
Entrepreneurial
  55:2
entrepreneurs 15:9
environment 31:21
equity 48:20 49:3
especially 23:22
  24:3 43:15 45:22
  92:15
essential 20:22
  58:13
essentially 59:4
established 91:22
  99:22
estimate 89:13
  96:17,18

estimated 22:13
ethnic 112:15,17
event 29:6
events 29:13
Everett 1:15 92:20
  93:2
everybody 51:17
  53:16 80:2,10
  97:16
everyone's 32:18
evolve 100:19
evolves 100:22
example 27:14
  48:16 101:6
  110:21
examples 46:9
excavate 56:2
exceeds 66:12
exception 30:5,8
  39:7
excited 6:21 16:18
  26:14 53:1,19
  58:21
exciting 59:17,22
  93:8 101:1 105:7
excludes 74:8
exclusion 22:20
  96:19,20
Excuse 78:6
executive 96:4
  109:22 110:3,8
exercise 84:10
exists 11:14 47:5
expanded 29:8
expansion 29:14
expect 38:20
experience 24:2
  70:3,9 85:16 93:5
  93:13 96:15
expertise 16:9 59:8
experts 58:17
expires 4:22
explained 28:10
explaining 98:5
extend 20:20
extra 4:8 61:10
  92:21

extraordinary 14:5
  34:4
extreme 91:12,13
extremely 58:11
e-Rate 24:21 26:16
  27:1,3,4

F

fabulous 10:22
face 33:7 77:22
  86:7,14
faces 10:20
facilities 27:5
fact 10:6 20:3
  23:11 52:1 68:13
  83:9,13 85:8 99:3
factor 72:19 73:6
  96:13 97:2 98:5
  98:14 105:22
factors 74:17 82:12
  83:16 95:5,9
facts 16:8
fall 87:5
falling 112:19
false 79:22
familiar 10:20
  21:14 24:11
family 100:6 108:7
far 71:1 104:19
faster 16:16 32:21
  90:13
favor 44:5,19 50:7
FCC 1:9,21 2:1 3:3
  3:9,14 9:14 10:17
  12:3 17:22 19:4
  26:8 32:15 41:19
  46:6,8 60:20
  94:17 97:10,15
  107:13,16 110:7
  110:10,11,19
  111:9
FCC's 53:16
features 5:11
February 64:17
federal 1:1 2:2,2,3
  3:3 18:18 111:9
feel 11:1 38:12 80:7

82:20 87:4,13
108:15
grow 29:17 100:19
grows 88:17
growth 71:9
guarantee 102:8
guess 93:15
guidance 54:22
55:3
guy 60:9
guys 6:1 76:9

H
half 24:7,16 41:14
70:1,2,11,17 74:2
74:6 78:3 98:13
101:18
handheld 68:2,11
handhelds 68:5
handled 47:20
happened 45:16
happening 16:19
18:1 31:8 112:18
happens 33:17 79:3
101:2
happy 13:20 112:8
hard 13:1,13 14:4
16:22 17:1 18:12
18:21 19:2,8,11
21:20 55:10,13
63:18 106:4
hard-working
113:7
head 12:1 19:1
53:14
headed 38:22
headings 21:4
heads 18:4,4,7
51:14 81:14
healthcare 31:14
healthy 18:3
hear 10:15 16:17
42:1 51:6 60:16
92:5 95:22 110:6
heard 4:8 40:2,3
46:18 88:22 89:16
94:19 100:20

hearing 28:13,13
hearings 29:5
heavily 55:20 87:8
87:10
held 18:17 19:22
help 12:10 31:6
33:6 59:8 60:9
85:19 89:6 90:20
100:13
helpful 54:4
helping 31:7,21
helps 13:14 66:2
97:5 98:4
Henry 1:10,13 3:5
3:25 7:22 10:7
11:19 51:18
hey 17:15 20:11
he'll 37:3 113:12,13
high 24:5 25:13
70:2,7 85:8,9
98:12 101:11
103:17
higher 82:20 88:11
104:15
highlights 97:9
102:17
high-level 66:21
Hill 7:9
hire 29:18
Hispanic 74:19
87:10
Hispanics 71:3,6
71:10,14 74:14
82:15,16 87:11
101:7
historically 48:9,15
hold 4:10
home 27:9 66:17
67:3,4 68:8,12,19
68:21,22 69:4,7
69:11 70:12,18
71:6 72:16 75:16
75:18,19 78:16,19
79:5,21 80:2
81:12,17,20 82:9
82:17,19 83:9,12
83:17,19,22 84:15

84:19 85:13
homework 24:10
24:15 25:3
hones 80:7
honestly 40:6
Honig 1:15 12:21
hope 17:3 25:17
27:6 36:2,19 51:3
59:6 64:8 86:13
113:19
hopeful 87:9 91:15
hoping 46:14 51:5
109:12
horizontal 16:12
Horrigan 2:4 3:15
5:13 21:10 28:9
60:11,17 61:20
64:2,12,16 69:1
72:21 74:2,13
77:6 78:12 87:6
87:20 88:14 91:18
94:2
Horrigan's 92:15
host 37:15
hour 101:19
house 67:14 110:1
household 67:12,19
households 67:5
70:10,13
HTML 32:12
huge 55:16 70:5
hurdles 86:7

I
idea 17:14
ideally 80:5
ideas 17:5,7 18:7,8
18:14 20:6 27:11
27:12 37:20 38:1
identifiable 34:9
identified 45:21
identify 56:19
identifying 57:2
Illinois 95:1 102:2
impact 74:20
imperfect 79:10,12
implement 45:14

implementation
46:17
implemented 91:20
implications 91:4
importance 21:6
important 6:22
10:1 11:16 12:6,7
13:11 14:13,21
16:13,16 20:14,15
21:16 24:21 28:7
30:17 31:6 35:7
37:6 42:19 43:6
43:16 58:11,12
65:17 75:3 81:11
81:16 83:5,12
96:13 97:3,11
98:5 102:13
107:12 110:19
improve 80:22
improving 33:17
inappropriate 6:9
incentive 35:12,22
incidence 68:10
82:21
include 5:11 62:19
62:22 76:19 91:14
included 19:19
25:18 63:10 66:15
88:19
includes 5:7 27:21
including 14:19
25:21 26:11 79:15
inclusion 21:5,7,7
25:11 31:7 46:11
47:6
inclusive 39:13
93:13
income 24:6 69:19
69:21 70:10,14
72:19 73:2,7
74:16 97:19,21,22
98:1,2,4 103:7,7,8
104:10,12,15
incomes 70:11 73:3
inconvenience
23:18
incorrect 77:19

increase 15:10,11
15:12 16:13 30:21
increased 28:21
52:8
increases 71:15
increasingly 23:12
23:14,15 66:16
incredible 41:15
incredibly 11:16
independent 73:6
74:11
Indian 89:22 90:4
90:12 91:1,10,15
indicated 42:10
indicates 72:7,19
indication 89:10
indices 85:3
individuals 39:2
industrial 91:6
industries 48:11
49:5,16
industry 9:4
inferences 63:4
information 5:5
16:8 28:18 65:14
84:16,21 85:2,10
86:8 105:12 108:8
110:21 111:1,14
111:20,22
informed 56:12
infrastructure
33:22 34:2,3
71:19 75:21 76:5
76:5,14,19 77:16
88:22 89:5 90:10
infrastructures
32:4,16
infusions 35:12
Initiative 2:5 3:16
110:1
initiatives 99:11
innovation 21:22
34:14
innovative 29:22
input 15:18 28:14
29:13 37:7
inputs 61:3

inside 22:4
institute 44:12
institutions 27:8
   46:4
instruction 4:12
   54:3,21
intelligence 56:1,6
intelligently 43:21
intend 58:3
interagency 15:21
   110:5,9
interest 9:3 36:7
   61:16 75:10 77:11
   107:11
interested 107:22
interesting 87:1
   92:5 95:22 98:21
   109:11
interests 84:1
interface 105:14
internally 53:8
internet 10:1,6
   23:21 24:16,17
   42:12,15 67:2,12
   67:18 68:2,9,11
   68:14 69:6,11
   71:8 74:5 75:5
   79:20,20 81:1
   85:13,17 87:18
   93:7,7,11,17
   99:22 100:3,14,17
   102:13 103:2
   108:2
internet-based
   43:22
interrupt 10:8
inter-generational
   96:1
Introduction 3:4
investing 49:6
investments 48:20
invests 49:14,15
inviting 51:18
   92:13
involved 8:9,12
   34:19 36:4 39:10
   39:11,14

Islanders 110:2
issue 33:9 36:5
   46:19 47:20 53:6
   53:13 63:14 65:2
   93:16 94:1,9
   102:14 107:20
issues 3:6 5:12 8:1
   8:21 9:1,12 11:15
   12:20,21 13:3,14
   16:15 18:15 21:2
   23:9 25:11,19
   28:9 31:1,5 33:3,4
   33:7 36:20 39:11
   40:22 52:17,21
   53:22 54:10,11
   55:7,11,17 56:2,9
   56:15 59:11,15
   65:14 83:3 108:13
   109:5

J

Jackie 55:14
JAMES 1:19
Jamila 2:2 13:9
Jane 1:16 8:17,18
   42:3 43:19 45:2
January 57:12
Jeff 28:2 57:14
Jim 47:22 57:13
job 23:1,2,6,13,15
   23:20 34:5,11
   52:9 57:20,21
   95:19 101:12
   102:22 103:2,10
   104:13 109:12
jobs 23:16 105:11
Joe 55:13 109:3,16
John 2:4 3:15 5:13
   28:9 60:11,12,16
   76:20 78:6 86:22
   92:3,15 94:2
   97:18 105:20
John's 94:8
join 7:8 10:10
joined 5:13
joining 5:18
Joint 2:13,16,21

3:21 5:15 92:6
   93:21
Jon 2:13 3:19 21:9
Jon's 22:5
journey 38:15
Julius 1:22 3:10
   40:3
June 51:7,10
   113:19

K

K 1:17
Kaplan 11:3
Karen 1:17 61:14
   74:9 86:20 88:10
   109:19 110:14
keep 46:15 51:19
keeping 8:5
keeps 26:4 110:22
key 42:11 61:3 72:4
   97:8,19
kids 24:7,11 25:6,8
   25:13
kind 15:5 26:14
   39:22 52:5 55:3
   55:22 57:4 64:7
   81:13 96:11 97:9
   100:18 104:14
kinds 63:5
king 104:19
knew 96:8
know 8:1 11:4,5,7
   12:5,14 13:6,13
   13:22 14:5,10,13
   15:2,12 16:20
   17:12,13,19 18:21
   19:7,12,21,22
   20:11 21:9 22:2
   22:18 23:5,6 25:1
   25:5 26:18,22
   28:19 29:2,8,22
   30:5 31:19 32:4,7
   33:13 35:4 36:10
   36:21 37:2 38:5
   38:14,16 40:6
   41:2,3,3 42:6 47:3
   47:11 52:4,9,11

52:12,22 55:11,13
   55:15 56:16 59:6
   68:4 73:22 74:3
   78:8 79:3 87:15
   90:21 93:7 96:14
   98:12 99:8,15
   100:5,7,9 101:18
   102:11 103:18,19
   104:4,6 106:13,19
   107:1 108:9,16
   110:12 111:4,5,7
   111:9,11 112:18
   112:22 113:5,10
knowing 73:18
knowledge 12:9
   14:8 15:11
known 6:18
knows 28:2 53:17
   56:13
Kreisman 2:2 3:2
   4:3 13:8

L

labeled 65:20
lack 71:19 76:19
   77:10,11 86:2,6
   90:9
lag 71:16,20
lagging 22:2,5
   27:18
lands 88:20 89:15
   90:9
landscape 16:7
languages 111:6
languishing 56:16
   56:19
large 62:11,13 65:9
   72:11 74:20 87:22
   93:10 94:5 96:4
   97:22 98:9 107:21
largely 23:7 71:18
   90:9
larger 49:1 94:8
late 7:10 110:3
latent 89:10
latest 100:10
Latinos 61:17

Laughter 12:2
   17:21 26:7 38:3
   40:4 42:5 93:3
   102:10 107:2
lead 34:8 91:4
leaders 89:18,21
   92:1
leading 19:6 34:14
   84:4
learn 91:3 95:21
   96:6 105:16
learned 32:1 95:19
   96:12
learning 85:3 95:18
   96:1,2,8
leave 37:13
leaving 6:19
lecture 102:7
led 14:14
Lee 92:8
left 19:7 38:7 99:9
legislative 48:5
legitimate 78:1
lend 46:12
lending 46:3,5
   53:21
length 31:10
letters 14:22
let's 60:10 62:5
   74:21 75:11
level 39:15 43:8
   69:17 84:12 88:11
   104:12 105:2
   112:17
levels 73:2 88:1
Li 2:21 3:23 92:17
   108:16
libraries 24:22
   26:17 27:7 101:6
   101:8,15
library 24:19 69:9
   95:18 102:7 104:3
   104:16
life 38:8 91:20
Lifeline 26:12
lifetime 26:10
likelihood 85:6

96:17
likes 113:7
limited 47:13 51:4
 101:19
limits 102:12
line 23:14 65:16
 68:16 70:16 97:15
lines 69:17,20
Link-Up 26:12
list 78:17 79:13
 81:6,9,13
listen 12:4 38:1
 39:3
listened 38:18
listening 37:16
 38:21 110:22
lists 81:18
literacy 27:11,17
 28:8 30:12 31:7
 54:15 82:2 83:2
 83:16 86:16 90:14
 91:13 100:15
literally 11:6
little 6:8 7:10 14:16
 42:20 57:16 62:1
 67:1 68:6 69:14
 73:12 84:9 94:7
 105:4 110:21
 111:1 112:2,10,12
 112:13
live 75:21 76:1,8,10
 76:12 77:13
lived 67:18
living 70:10
loans 48:20,22
 49:10
locations 89:1
long 36:22 38:14
 40:1 56:10 80:14
 97:7
longer 39:5
longitudinal 93:19
 108:21
look 16:8 23:2 35:9
 36:4,15 39:19
 40:21 42:22 43:1
 43:13,14 47:10

58:16,22 72:12,18
 75:8 80:5,5 81:21
 93:15 103:6,7,16
 105:1 107:21
 108:15,22 110:20
looked 104:8
looking 15:7 22:22
 23:20 30:1 34:19
 41:12 46:6 58:9
 58:19 64:18 94:3
 99:4 102:22 103:2
 103:10 105:11
 109:1,4
looks 36:8 112:10
loss 7:5
lot 4:8 6:16 15:14
 19:7 20:8 28:14
 33:2 40:7 41:22
 50:19 52:14 53:17
 54:15,17 56:1
 58:7 66:4,12,16
 70:19 72:3,6 73:1
 85:11 96:5,12,22
 97:9 106:15 107:6
 107:6 109:6
 111:12,19 113:9
lots 75:4 102:15
Louis 94:22
love 29:1,4 39:6
 112:20
lover 113:8
low 22:11 24:5
lower 21:19 22:9
 22:10 24:1 30:2
 73:2,3,6,10 85:3
 104:12,15
lowest 103:8
low-income 22:7
LUCEY 2:12
lucky 11:1

M

magnitude 73:8
Mago 1:16 8:17,20
 42:4,8 64:9,15
 76:20
main 21:4 81:11

82:8,18 83:8,18
maintain 32:3,16
major 97:13,22
making 8:10 10:5
 26:12,17 31:12
 39:7,11 45:5,18
 54:16 56:9 63:3
 92:7
Managing 17:2
 18:11 53:14
MARCH 1:6
Mark 17:4
marketing 30:3
markets 35:6,15
materials 46:10
 53:3,7,9,21 54:3,3
matter 16:2 73:9
 113:21
matters 4:15 7:13
 7:17
MBDA 16:1
mean 4:5 18:3 59:8
 84:13 100:4 108:1
 109:19 111:3
meaningful 56:7
means 62:15 65:8
meant 32:5 41:22
measure 78:3,15
Meats 28:20
media 2:20 3:6
 5:12 6:13,15,20
 8:1,21 9:3 12:21
 52:17,20 55:5
 56:14 57:19 90:5
 91:9 111:18
media-rich 101:13
medium 46:1
meet 17:10 36:8
 45:12 91:11
meeting 1:9,9 4:17
 4:21 5:10 6:9
 27:1 51:7 52:11
 113:19
meetings 50:19
members 1:12 4:15
 5:15 12:12 20:21
mention 7:7 26:9

28:5 31:4 57:8
mentioned 18:22
 39:17 52:14,16,19
 53:12 54:7 64:10
 94:2 97:18
mentor 113:9
mentoring 19:4
 55:3
menu 77:9 79:13
 81:19
messages 105:8
met 8:22 40:1
 45:14 56:10,14
 57:11 109:22
methodology 76:4
methods 72:9
mezzanine 49:2
micro 48:22
microphone 37:10
mics 4:12
middle 11:4
middleman 18:2
mid-sentence 42:4
Mignon 1:22 40:2
millennials 106:12
Miller 55:14 109:3
million 47:14
minding 109:10
Mine 87:14
minorities 5:17
 93:6,17 94:1,3,7,8
 100:2,11 101:11
 101:11
minority 3:17 22:7
 48:17 57:18,19
 58:9,13 82:20
 108:13
minute 4:13 13:7
 24:22 38:16
minutes 6:12 11:13
mobile 29:21 34:1
 34:14,22 35:17
 36:6 68:3,13
 109:1,2
model 95:2,7 96:16
modeled 27:12
 94:16

models 91:7,11
modem 78:20 79:7
 80:13
moderating 57:21
modern 84:15
mom 106:14,20
moment 39:1
money 31:20 32:20
 33:1,1 49:14,15
monolithic 84:19
monopoly 18:6
month 27:2 72:3,6
 72:10,13 74:4
months 7:20 13:21
 27:2 41:13 52:10
moot 57:3
motion 43:19 44:9
 44:15 45:1 49:21
 49:22 50:4,11
move 8:11 40:12
 51:12 57:3 59:10
 59:21 60:10 74:21
 75:11,11 92:11
moved 23:8,12
moves 9:15
moving 23:7 46:15
 60:2 89:5
multiple 83:13,20
multiples 79:5
music 4:11 113:8
mute 4:4,9

N

NARASAKI 1:17
 61:15 63:13 74:10
 86:22 107:3
 109:21 112:8
Narasaki's 108:14
nation 88:8
national 3:17 15:17
 54:12,22 55:8
 62:4,9,11,18
 63:20 66:4,12
 71:4,16,20 87:22
 89:22
nationwide 89:21
Native 62:14,20

202-234-4433

pending 55:17
penetration 89:14
people 4:3,6 6:22
  11:7,17 20:2,8
  27:8 29:18 30:4,9
  31:7 32:4,6,10
  33:6,14,17 36:22
  58:21 61:9 66:7
  66:16 67:7,9,12
  67:15,17 68:5,7
  68:10,15,18 69:3
  69:6,8,10 70:1,7,8
  70:12 72:2,5,10
  73:21 74:8 75:5
  75:20 76:21 77:7
  77:15 78:8,17
  79:3,5 80:8,9,17
  81:3,6,19 82:9
  83:8,9,14,19,21
  84:14,18,21 85:1
  85:12,14 89:6,11
  92:10 95:21,22
  96:17 100:22
  103:20 104:3
  106:5 107:3
  111:21 112:19
people's 81:14
percent 21:18,22
  22:10,13,16 67:3
  67:22 68:1,8,20
  68:22 69:3,4,5,6
  70:6,8,14 71:4,5,6
  71:12,14 75:15,16
  75:17,18,22 76:9
  76:11,16 80:1
  82:10,13,15,17,22
  83:3 85:4,7 86:1,5
  86:12 87:11 89:15
  98:11 102:22
  103:8 104:21
  112:5
percentage 67:4,16
  101:11
perfect 78:2 80:4
performed 90:5
permitted 77:8
person 37:17,18

60:7 67:14,20
personal 100:5
personally 101:21
perspective 77:13
pertaining 73:17
  82:1,1,3,10 83:1,4
Pew 71:8,11 80:22
  81:2 94:14,16,17
  97:14
phone 4:4 5:7 6:2
  66:18 67:22 68:9
  79:2 104:19,22
  105:1,6,21
phones 4:4 29:21
  66:15,17 84:17
picked 4:20
piecemeal 97:1
pigeonhole 112:4
piggy-back 97:10
pin 80:16 81:14
  89:14
ping 90:19
place 9:22 47:22
places 37:22
  101:15,16 102:12
plan 5:14 16:10
  17:1 19:14 21:4,8
  25:17 26:3,9,15
  26:16 27:10,11,21
  30:15 31:11 32:1
  32:5,9 33:13,15
  33:16 34:18 42:17
  51:10 52:15 54:12
  55:1,9 60:21 61:5
  63:14,20 64:3,6
  76:3 89:16 90:1
  90:18 99:10
planned 10:10
plans 48:1 91:6,16
platform 20:17,18
  20:19
platforms 9:4 43:2
  43:15,17 44:14
play 15:8 26:18,18
  35:7 99:6
plays 72:20
plea 60:4

please 4:4,9,12
  66:20 69:15 70:18
  94:12 95:6 97:11
  98:8,19 99:19
  102:14,20 103:4
  103:13 104:1,17
  104:19,22 108:4
pleased 9:16 11:13
  14:3 15:19 26:15
  28:3,6 42:13
  59:14 110:6
pleasure 6:10
  37:14 60:18 92:14
plug 33:17
plus 41:9
pockets 105:15
point 8:7 10:3 17:3
  32:13,14 33:11
  60:6 67:4 68:13
pointing 68:3
points 9:8 56:20,21
  67:16 101:5,8
policies 15:7
policy 6:15 20:4
  96:20,22 97:4
  109:5,16
Political 2:13,16,21
  3:21 5:15
popular 105:9
population 63:6
  85:8 86:1,12
  88:21 104:21
  105:15 111:11,13
populations 24:5
  48:10,15 63:6
  64:5 65:11 88:17
portfolio 48:19
portion 53:18 74:5
position 57:1
positive 85:11
positives 79:22
possible 10:4 46:11
  56:6 58:16 77:9
possibly 73:14
postings 23:6,13,15
potential 10:7 15:5
  47:7

PowerPoint 5:9
PPM 8:3,4,11
practical 17:5
practices 18:16
  19:3,3,4,5,6
preclude 111:14
preliminary 4:14
present 1:12,21 2:1
  4:21 5:16
presentation 5:11
  60:15
presentations 5:9
preserve 35:1 36:9
president 2:15 6:15
  6:18 110:2
presiding 1:10
pressure 5:1
pretend 38:1
pretty 85:14,20
  104:20 112:12
prices 72:15
Princeton 94:13
principle 56:17
prior 60:21 71:10
  83:10 96:15
private 30:21
probably 14:16
  47:3 52:10 61:8
  62:22 79:6 85:15
  108:20
problem 25:10
  53:11 76:14 89:5
  94:4
procedurally 56:19
proceeding 14:18
  42:22
proceedings 5:19
process 8:10 19:15
  19:16 33:14 41:1
  46:3,22 47:2,18
  53:2,15,18
procurement 18:13
produced 14:21
products 48:11,19
professor 102:1
program 27:16
programming

111:6
programs 18:20
progress 19:9,9
  56:7,9 57:7
Project 6:13,16,20
  71:8 81:1
prominent 88:20
promise 99:16
promised 92:9
promote 31:13
promotes 36:6
promoting 9:2
properties 53:22
proposed 5:8
proud 19:14
provide 31:19
  32:22 35:20 49:15
  53:20
provided 49:4 52:3
provides 48:12
  70:19
providing 33:5
  37:7 48:16,22
  49:1
public 24:4 27:8
  90:5 91:8 101:5,8
  102:12 104:15
public-private
  30:18
publish 32:7
pull 9:11
pulling 37:21
purposes 66:4
put 4:10 10:18 21:7
  39:16,22 53:7
  54:14 55:22 58:1
  107:18
puts 12:14
putting 12:13
  57:22 59:20
puzzles 113:8,14
P-R-O-C-E-E-D-...
  4:1
p.m 1:10 4:2
  113:22

———————
Q
———————

re-calibrate 48:7
re-energized 14:2
rich 95:4 102:15
  109:13
richer 108:20
richness 105:3
Rick 11:3
right 18:9 23:3
  32:17 34:10 39:4
  42:2 43:18 44:2,4
  47:5 49:20,22
  50:6 60:10 71:1
  75:12 89:8 97:8
  97:15 104:9 107:7
  107:10 109:17,19
rightly 17:11
ringtone 106:5,11
  106:17
rising 22:20
risks 34:9
Rivera 1:10,13 3:5
  3:25 4:16 5:20,21
  7:4 10:9 11:20,22
  41:21 42:6 43:18
  44:4,7,9,18,21
  45:1 49:20 50:6,9
  50:11,22 59:13
  92:2,13 109:9
  110:12 112:1
  113:12
robust 39:12
  105:14 108:14
role 15:8 26:18
  35:7
roll 36:14
room 1:9 33:10
  61:9 68:4
roughly 22:13
  76:16 104:21
round 57:12,14
rule 30:5,8 39:7
rulemaking 42:22
  43:13 44:13
rules 10:2 15:7
  43:1,11 44:11,13
run 19:15 30:9 97:7
running 7:10 110:4

rural 22:8 30:11
  71:18,20
rural/non 71:17
rush 108:9

——— S ———

sample 62:4,8,15
  63:12 65:10,22
  66:10,12,15,18,19
  87:21 94:3,4
San 94:22
save 50:1
saving 33:1
saw 13:7 25:17
  28:12
saying 42:8 61:9
  76:7,13 80:14
  98:22
says 17:11 21:5
  25:4 89:14 107:21
SBA 16:1 29:6
  54:17 55:1
scary 84:22
schedule 20:6
schedules 5:4 6:3
Schlick 53:6
school 24:3,3 25:14
  68:18 70:2,7
  95:18 98:12
  103:17
schools 24:4,22
  26:17 27:4,6,7
  101:15 104:16
Schwartzman 1:17
  6:5,7 68:17 73:20
  113:2
scope 49:4
scramble 24:19
  25:1,2
searchable 32:13
second 8:3,16 44:1
  44:10,15 46:16
  49:22 61:22
secondarily 55:1
Secondly 9:18
  84:18
sector 47:5

see 8:15 10:13,19
  10:20 15:18 30:13
  31:9,14 32:5
  38:20 40:19 55:14
  55:15 60:16 69:21
  70:5,15 71:5,18
  83:18 91:17 97:21
  98:14,15,18 99:1
  100:1 101:1,4
  103:7,18,21
  104:10,14,20
  105:2,4,7,17
  108:18 113:19
seeing 38:22 99:9
  105:9
seen 28:19 90:6
segmentation
  107:17
segmenting 84:9
seizing 36:19
select 77:8
self-reporting
  76:21 77:7
sell 86:5
sending 105:7
  106:6
senior 6:14 70:16
seniors 22:9 99:9
sense 65:21 74:11
sent 45:14 53:3
separate 23:10
series 14:14 17:5
  27:21 28:1 30:14
  31:1,11
serious 23:19
seriously 25:11,18
  28:1
served 64:1
service 12:18 20:17
  22:15 26:11 48:16
  77:3
services 31:20
  32:22 33:6 48:21
  65:3
session 15:3 58:6
  101:18
sessions 15:4 56:11

58:19
set 14:10 71:1
  77:21 89:2
seven 29:9 40:8
severely 47:13
shape 112:12
share 6:11 35:15,16
  36:7 92:14
shares 90:18
sharing 35:10
sharpness 103:12
short 97:6
shoulder 80:6
show 61:22 86:12
showed 71:12
  112:14
shows 30:11 69:16
  71:1 72:12 84:9
  112:11
sides 36:5
signed 110:2
significance 74:18
  104:7,7
significant 21:3
  63:18 73:21 74:15
  86:7,14 94:10
  98:17 99:4,7,12
  99:17 102:21
  103:3 106:3
  108:18 111:2
significantly 28:21
  101:9
similar 98:7,16,18
  103:14
similarities 94:16
  98:3
Similarly 70:9
simply 33:5 72:7
  77:7
sincerely 37:19
single 39:20
sir 10:16
sit 45:15
sitting 10:21
size 48:22 63:12
  65:10,22 66:10,12
  87:21 94:3,4

96:19 111:10
sizes 48:11
skill 77:10
skills 25:8 73:18
  86:2,7 89:7
skip 62:5 74:22
  84:2
sleep 11:8,9
sleeves 36:15
slide 61:10,21 62:1
  62:3,6,7,7 65:19
  65:20 66:19,20,21
  69:15,16,22 70:18
  70:19 72:1,4,17
  75:12 80:18,18
  81:17,18 83:6,7,7
  84:2,2,9 87:2
  93:15,18 94:11
  95:6 97:10 98:7
  98:19 99:19
  102:14,19 103:3
  103:13 104:1,2,17
  104:19,22 106:8
  107:8 108:4
slides 61:6,7 62:6
  69:2 74:22 75:3
  84:4
slow 79:16
small 14:19 15:9
  28:12,13,16 29:6
  30:9,18,22 31:1
  34:6 35:13,14
  46:1 54:4,16,18
  54:20 55:4 58:8
  62:14 63:3,11
  68:10 69:10
smaller 46:2
smart 113:7
Smith 13:12
snapshot 66:22
social 35:18 108:6
solutions 58:6,8,10
  58:18
solve 89:4
somebody 59:18
  67:11 78:16 79:11
  112:5

someplace 69:7
son 96:7,12
sorely 36:1 88:15
sorry 62:6 87:9
   109:20
sort 52:8,18 53:20
   57:15 61:21 69:13
   73:4,14 79:21
   80:13 85:1 86:10
   91:5,6 96:22
   103:16
sorting 70:20 95:4
sorts 37:21 80:10
   85:4
sought 8:11 19:18
sound 38:2
sounds 17:14
sour 86:8
sources 72:8
southern 37:18
space 18:19 39:12
   49:11 78:13
   100:18
Spanish-speaking
   66:14
speak 4:4,5,12 37:3
   92:4
speaking 92:18
special 6:5 90:16
specific 43:11
specifically 47:6
   74:4 75:9
specificity 79:4
specifics 9:5
specify 74:7
spectrum 33:12
   34:20,21,22 35:10
   35:17 85:22
   103:16
speed 79:16
spend 32:19,20
   45:11
spending 111:10
spent 15:14 72:5
spirit 61:21
spoke 29:5
spring 4:17

St 94:22
staff 2:1 13:12,15
   52:7 56:3 58:1
   96:10
stand 85:14 113:18
standard 63:9
stands 102:20
start 7:17 69:2
   72:22 73:4,11
   94:3 105:3
started 6:4 7:7
   27:13 29:7 46:3
starting 34:15 99:1
state 58:14
stated 89:17
statement 8:13
States 21:17 22:1,4
   27:19
station 111:5
stations 35:6,14
   111:1,3
statistical 62:16
   63:4 66:3 104:7
statistically 63:17
   74:15 94:10
   108:18
statistics 21:14
   22:18
status 74:12
stay 38:17,19 93:1
   108:6
staying 95:10
steady 72:15
stealing 113:4
step 81:14,14
stepping 6:14
steps 13:20
Steve 17:2,15 53:12
   53:13
sticking 56:20
sticky 107:14
stop 7:11 10:13
   20:11,22 37:5
stores 29:9,9
story 29:4 74:16
   98:21
strategies 57:19

strategy 15:3
streamed 20:1
Street 1:9 29:7
strengthening
   15:21
stripped 79:22
STROBEL 2:20
strong 34:11
   103:22
structure 35:22
structured 36:16
students 24:6,17
   102:6
studies 2:14,18,22
   3:22 5:16 93:9
   94:18 95:20,22
   97:13 98:22
   109:13
study 60:14 63:16
   64:10 65:4 88:12
   90:3,3,4,11 91:3,4
   91:8,9 93:19,21
   93:22 94:6,15,17
   94:17,17 95:2
   96:2 97:10,15
   107:13,17 108:10
   108:21,22
stuff 6:17 89:12
sub 63:5 64:4 65:10
subcommittee 3:6
   7:19 8:1,22 50:13
   52:17,21 55:12
   109:14
subcommittees
   12:20 14:12 50:17
   51:6 59:5 60:5
subgroup 8:21
   88:21
subject 21:4
submitted 23:17
subsequently
   104:14
substitute 68:16
subtle 99:18
sub-fields 49:6
succeed 29:17 91:6
   91:7

success 15:12 29:15
successful 27:12
   46:13
sudden 105:4
Sudoku 113:13
sufficient 26:21
suggested 17:19
   35:13 48:13
suggestions 17:8
   25:19,20 112:3
summarize 26:3,5
supplement 94:20
supplementary
   68:14
supplied 46:9
support 45:7,17
   48:12 52:3,5
   92:21
supporter 113:6
supposed 24:9,14
   41:9
sure 4:10 7:9 8:10
   9:14 13:2 18:14
   18:22 19:5 26:12
   26:17 28:15 31:12
   33:10,21 34:1
   54:13,16,21 111:7
surrounding 65:14
   66:3
survey 3:14 22:5
   61:1,3 62:5,10,11
   63:7 64:20,21,21
   64:21 65:7,9,18
   66:6,13 67:7,10
   67:21 72:2 75:4
   76:2,10 77:8,13
   77:15,18 78:7,14
   80:7 82:8 83:10
   83:13,18 88:4
   94:13
surveys 66:4,13
   87:22
Susan 2:19 12:22
   45:10 52:20 53:3
   109:19
suspect 36:22
Sutter 1:18 3:8

   5:12 7:22 12:22
   45:3 50:16 105:20
   106:3,16,20 107:7
SW 1:9
SYLVIA 2:20
sympathetic 35:3
system 100:21

—————
T
table 57:13,14
tabs 8:5
tabulated 62:21
tacitly 53:9
tackle 16:14 25:10
   25:19 27:22 30:15
   33:7 34:9
tackling 26:12
tail 57:12
take 7:1 9:17 12:13
   14:3 15:1 20:6
   27:6 28:1 30:7
   39:19 43:19 44:14
   49:21 52:1 78:13
   90:12 93:10
takeaway 72:5
   83:12
taken 13:20 29:6
   37:4 95:6
takes 4:13 9:22
   100:21
talk 11:12 13:17
   14:16 16:9 22:12
   24:3 28:4 31:10
   45:15 46:11 56:14
   58:18 60:12 64:20
   73:11,12 99:11
   100:20
talked 19:20 43:3
   46:22 48:1
talking 12:16 15:14
   46:20 69:8
talks 62:1,3 104:2
   105:10
task 8:2,4,16,16,17
   45:4,9 49:11
   50:13,17 110:5,9
TDF 46:22 48:1,12

50:1
teach 101:21
teacher 25:4
teachers 24:3,4
teaching 102:2
team 11:3 15:17
  19:8 20:22 21:6
  21:10 40:20 54:9
  55:13,22 56:10
  76:2 78:4 92:19
  94:21
teases 103:11
technique 77:17
  79:10 80:15,15
techniques 30:3
  80:19,22
technology 16:6
  55:5 65:15 84:12
  84:16,21 85:2,10
  86:9 95:13 111:18
telecom 43:5 47:6
  49:10
telecommunicati...
  48:8 49:7
telephone 5:5
  20:17 22:15 62:5
  62:10
telephonically 8:22
television 111:5
tell 7:2 11:13 19:11
  24:2 37:21 51:14
  74:5 78:18
telling 63:19
Tells 24:20
ten 22:22 100:9
tend 101:7,13
tended 81:2
term 97:6
terms 19:17,17
  30:1 49:3 57:16
  69:18 70:20 73:7
  76:21 77:1 87:4
  87:17 93:6 94:8
  99:7 101:3 102:13
  102:21 105:11
  108:1
terribly 59:22

terrific 7:16 10:18
  15:15
testify 11:10
text 105:7
texting 107:4,5,6
texture 66:2
textured 65:14
thank 5:3,18,21 6:2
  6:7 7:4,22 8:20
  9:9 12:4,19 13:15
  37:5,14,15,20
  38:13 39:18 41:17
  41:19,21 42:3
  43:18 45:2,3
  50:12,17,21 51:16
  51:18,20 52:1
  55:12 59:12,13,19
  60:11,16,17 61:15
  64:8 88:5 92:2,7
  92:11,12,13,20
  93:18 109:9,10
  113:3,10,15,16,20
thanks 12:22 13:5
  13:9 14:9 21:9
  42:2 50:15,22
  64:15 86:22 92:19
thereto 84:13
the-Beltway 37:19
thin 104:6 108:17
thing 7:6 12:7
  18:10 21:3 23:5
  26:14 28:6 31:22
  32:7 80:14 84:22
  85:1,2 91:7 94:20
  95:1 99:18 101:21
  102:20 108:8
  110:15 112:22
things 15:2 16:2
  29:22 30:6,7
  31:22 37:15 38:6
  39:5,21 52:14
  60:2 77:21 95:12
  95:15 96:5,14,15
  97:9,17,19 100:8
  100:10 101:12,20
  105:9,12
think 6:10 8:12

11:3 13:3,11 15:5
  15:6,15 16:2,17
  17:5,12,20 18:2
  19:2,6 20:5,9,10
  20:11,16 21:1,3
  22:12 23:11,11,21
  26:19,20 27:16
  28:6,18 30:16
  31:6 33:14 34:10
  35:8 36:3,18 38:6
  38:21 39:7 40:8
  41:6,7 42:10,18
  42:20 43:2 45:21
  46:10,18 52:4,19
  53:11,16 57:4,9
  58:6,20 59:1,3,9
  59:16,21 71:11
  84:21,22 85:1
  87:10 88:17 89:3
  91:2 96:20 97:3
  99:10 103:11
  105:6 110:18
  111:8,13,16,20
  112:2,9
thinking 15:8
  33:11 34:20 100:6
  108:2
third 8:3 66:10
Thomas 2:5 3:12
thought 9:2 75:10
thoughtful 113:6
three 7:20 8:2 9:7
  14:19,20 21:4
  97:13
three-quarters
  67:1
thrilled 37:3 45:19
Thursday 102:4
time 5:3 6:2 11:5,6
  11:9,18 12:9,13
  15:14 27:2 33:8
  37:4 40:17 45:11
  45:20 46:9 51:5,9
  56:3 57:10 75:10
  84:2 92:4 93:1
  101:19 104:13
  107:11 109:11

111:10
timeframe 51:10
times 9:1 29:12
  43:3
today 5:4,11,18 7:8
  9:8 13:17 16:18
  23:5,19 51:19
  60:19 61:8 62:2
  66:16 92:4,20
today's 5:8
told 4:19 10:8,9
Tom 13:5 14:3,5,13
  14:15 15:2,20
  16:11,18 17:4
  18:4,22 30:16
  31:2 37:2 39:19
  45:12 47:9 51:13
  59:13 60:3 110:13
tomorrow 11:11
  38:10
Tom's 60:9
Toni 1:14 12:22
  64:13 109:12
  110:14 112:20
tool 90:16
tools 10:4,7 24:12
  25:7,14
topic 20:4,7 23:9
touch 13:19 33:9
  61:8 64:5 108:6
  113:18
touched 36:21 38:6
  42:19
touching 102:16
toughest 86:4
track 110:22
Traditionally 49:2
training 19:3 30:21
  54:16 89:5
transformation
  26:10
transition 31:17
transparency 31:5
tremendous 21:10
  27:20 35:17 57:7
  57:20
trend 72:12

trends 3:18 108:19
tribal 22:10,14
  27:22 88:19 89:4
  89:15,18,20,20
  90:9,19 91:22
trick 113:4
tried 20:2 108:15
tries 93:5
troubling 21:15
  22:19,21 88:8
truly 39:8 66:18
truth 23:7 25:9
try 9:11,20 20:6,8
  27:22 50:1,19
  51:19 59:20 61:12
  76:4 77:15 80:16
  80:21 81:1 91:19
  93:1,15 95:8
  96:17,18 99:11
  105:17 107:22
  109:2
trying 21:20 87:6
  93:12 95:3 97:1
  97:17 107:19
  111:15
Tuesday 102:3
turn 5:19 6:4 7:18
Turner-Lee 2:15
  3:21 92:17
Turner-Lee's 22:6
Turning 72:1
TV 35:6,14
tweaked 40:14
Twenty-two 82:22
two 9:18 14:17 27:2
  32:3,16 41:14
  56:10 62:6 63:21
  65:16 67:17 81:14
  82:20 86:9 109:13
two-step 81:5
two-thirds 67:2
Ty 113:2
type 101:13 103:14
  108:7
types 38:20 78:17
  79:13
typically 69:8

23:18 27:15 29:11
41:13,14 71:11
72:15 89:19 99:5
100:7,9
yellow 86:10
Ying 2:21 3:23
92:17 104:4
young 106:11
younger 73:4 107:3

Z

zero 29:10 93:5,22
zeroed 50:2
zeroing 109:1,7

$

$2 47:15
$20,000 103:9
$41 72:5,13
$50k 70:14
$50,000 70:11
$80 47:14

1

10 3:10 74:22 85:7
86:1 89:15 111:6
100 112:5
109 3:25
11 74:22
12 49:9 75:1
12th 1:9
12-year-old 96:7
120 63:2
13 75:12
14 49:9 68:8 80:18
14th 29:7
15 81:17,18 86:11
16 83:7,7
19 83:3

2

2 6:11 67:4,15
2,300 66:1,7
2-hour 58:6
2.0 27:1
2:00 1:10
2:05 4:2
20 84:2,3 87:2

100:7
2009 71:12
2010 1:6
2012 65:6
22 69:4 75:16
24 1:6
26 87:10

3

3 62:3 65:21 93:15
30 68:1
31 76:16
35 69:3 75:15 85:4
86:5
36 82:10,13

4

4 3:2 76:11 92:10
4:04 113:22
40 29:10 71:13
445 1:9
46 70:6 71:12
49 71:6

5

5 3:4 22:13 76:9
5,005 62:10
50 29:10 99:5
51 3:12
52 82:15
59 71:5

6

6 69:5,5 72:18
75:17,18 80:1
6mhz 35:15
60 3:14
65 21:18,22 22:9,15
67:3 68:22 71:4
72:20 106:21
67 68:20

7

7 3:7
78 102:22

8

8 72:1

80 98:11 104:21
82 70:8
84 59:17
86 67:21
87 70:14

9

9 74:22
92 3:18 103:8